



2020

## Two Analytical Essays

Abigail Rueger

University of Kentucky, [abigail.rueger@gmail.com](mailto:abigail.rueger@gmail.com)

Digital Object Identifier: <https://doi.org/10.13023/etd.2020.256>

[Right click to open a feedback form in a new tab to let us know how this document benefits you.](#)

### Recommended Citation

Rueger, Abigail, "Two Analytical Essays" (2020). *Theses and Dissertations--Music*. 162.  
[https://uknowledge.uky.edu/music\\_etds/162](https://uknowledge.uky.edu/music_etds/162)

This Master's Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Music at UKnowledge. It has been accepted for inclusion in Theses and Dissertations--Music by an authorized administrator of UKnowledge. For more information, please contact [UKnowledge@lsv.uky.edu](mailto:UKnowledge@lsv.uky.edu).

## **STUDENT AGREEMENT:**

I represent that my thesis or dissertation and abstract are my original work. Proper attribution has been given to all outside sources. I understand that I am solely responsible for obtaining any needed copyright permissions. I have obtained needed written permission statement(s) from the owner(s) of each third-party copyrighted matter to be included in my work, allowing electronic distribution (if such use is not permitted by the fair use doctrine) which will be submitted to UKnowledge as Additional File.

I hereby grant to The University of Kentucky and its agents the irrevocable, non-exclusive, and royalty-free license to archive and make accessible my work in whole or in part in all forms of media, now or hereafter known. I agree that the document mentioned above may be made available immediately for worldwide access unless an embargo applies.

I retain all other ownership rights to the copyright of my work. I also retain the right to use in future works (such as articles or books) all or part of my work. I understand that I am free to register the copyright to my work.

## **REVIEW, APPROVAL AND ACCEPTANCE**

The document mentioned above has been reviewed and accepted by the student's advisor, on behalf of the advisory committee, and by the Director of Graduate Studies (DGS), on behalf of the program; we verify that this is the final, approved version of the student's thesis including all changes required by the advisory committee. The undersigned agree to abide by the statements above.

Abigail Rueger, Student

Dr. Michael Baker, Major Professor

Dr. Lance Brunner, Director of Graduate Studies

# TWO ANALYTICAL ESSAYS

---

## THESIS

---

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements  
for the degree of Master of Arts in  
the College of Fine Arts at the University of  
Kentucky

By  
Abigail Hope Rueger  
Lexington, Kentucky  
Director: Dr. Michael Baker, Professor of Music Theory  
Lexington, Kentucky  
2020  
Copyright © Abigail Hope Rueger 2020

## ABSTRACT OF THESIS

### TWO ANALYTICAL ESSAYS

These two essays address different issues regarding *Lieder*. Chapter 1 discusses moon topoi and traces the development of these topics from “naïve” in Gluck’s works to “sentimental” in the songs of Fanny Hensel, based on the philosophical ideas of Friedrich Schiller. Chapter 2 focuses on specific translation theory, drawing on work from Mona Baker and Zhang Qun-Xing, arguing that one cannot compare two song settings of different translations of the same poem, since the translator’s bias is inserted into the poetry, thereby changing the meaning of each song.

KEYWORDS: Music Theory, *Lieder*, Moon Topoi, Translation Theory

Abigail Rueger

4/23/2020



TWO ANALYTICAL ESSAYS

By

Abigail Hope Rueger

Michael Baker

---

Director of Thesis

Lance Brunner

---

Director of Graduate Studies

---

4/23/2020

---

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Examples.....	iv
Chapter One: Moon Topoi in Early Nineteenth-Century Lied, and the Transition from Naïve to Sentimental.....	1
Chapter Two: The Translator's Voice: its implications in two translations and text settings of "La Luna S'E Venuta a Lamentare" and <i>Ophelia Lied</i> .....	46
Bibliography.....	84
Vita.....	87

## LIST OF EXAMPLES

Example 1.1: Ludwig Heinrich Christoph Hölty, “An den Mond”	5
Example 1.2: Franz Schubert, “An den Mond,” mm. 1-9	7
Example 1.3: Johannes Brahms, “Mondenschein,” mm. 8-15	8
Example 1.4: Heinrich Heine, “Nacht liegt auf den fremden Wegen”	9
Example 1.5: Ludwig Heinrich Christoph Hölty, “Die Mainacht”	10
Example 1.6: Fanny Mendelssohn-Hensel, “Die Mainacht,” mm. 9-14	11
Example 1.7: Robert Schumann, “Die Lotosblume,” mm. 8-11	12
Example 1.8: Robert Schumann, “Mond, meine Seele Liebling,” mm. 24-36	13
Example 1.9: Friedrich Gottlieb Klopstock, “Die Sommernacht”	18
Example 1.10: Christoph Willibald Gluck, “Die Sommernacht”	21
Example 1.11: Franz Schubert, “Die Sommernacht,” mm. 1-10	24
Example 1.12: Franz Schubert, “Die Sommernacht,” 11-26	26
Example 1.13: Fanny Hensel, “Die Sommernacht,” mm. 1-8	28
Example 1.14: Fanny Hensel, “Die Sommernacht,” mm. 9-17	29
Example 1.15: Fanny Hensel, “Die Sommernacht,” mm. 18-26	30
Example 1.16: Fanny Hensel, “Die Sommernacht,” mm. 27-36	33
Example 1.17: Friedrich Gottlieb Klopstock, “Die frühen Gräber”	37
Example 1.18: Christoph Willibald Gluck, “Die Frühen Gräber,” mm. 1-18	38
Example 1.19: Franz Schubert, “Die Frühen Gräber”	40
Example 1.20: Fanny Hensel, “Die Frühen Gräber”	42
Example 2.1: Original Italian folk poem, “La luna s'è venuta a lamentare”	50
Example 2.2: Paul Heyse, “Der Mond hat eine schwere Klag’ erhoben”	51
Example 2.3: Ferdinand Gregorovius, “Klagen ist der Mond gekommen”	52
Example 2.4: Hugo Wolf, “Der Mond hat eine schwere Klag erhoben,” mm. 1-8	54
Example 2.5: Hugo Wolf, “Der Mond hat eine schwere Klag erhoben,” mm. 9-18	56
Example 2.6: Alexander Zemlinsky, “Klagen ist der Mond gekommen,” mm. 1-16	59
Example 2.7: Alexander Zemlinsky, “Klagen ist der Mond gekommen,” mm. 17-41	61
Example 2.8: Johannes Brahms, “Song I,” <i>Ophelia Lieder</i>	67
Example 2.9: Johannes Brahms, “Song II,” <i>Ophelia Lieder</i>	69
Example 2.10: Richard Strauss, “Erstes Lied der Ophelia,” mm. 1-26	71
Example 2.11: Johannes Brahms, “Song III,” <i>Ophelia Lieder</i> , mm. 1-11	73
Example 2.12: Richard Strauss, “Zweites Lied der Ophelia,” mm. 1-11	75
Example 2.13: Johannes Brahms, “Song IV,” <i>Ophelia Lieder</i>	76
Example 2.14: Johannes Brahms, “Song V,” <i>Ophelia Lieder</i> , mm. 1-7	78
Example 2.15: Richard Strauss, “Drittes Lied der Ophelia,” mm. 13-23	79
Example 2.16: Richard Strauss, “Drittes Lied der Ophelia,” mm. 24-29	80
Example 2.17: Richard Strauss, “Drittes Lied der Ophelia,” mm. 35-49	81
Example 2.18: Richard Strauss, “Drittes Lied der Ophelia,” mm. 50-58	82

## Chapter One: Moon Topoi in Early Nineteenth-Century Lieder, and the Transition from Naïve to Sentimental

The moon has been a perpetual source of captivation for humankind as far back as has been recorded. The sun and the moon are our “two great lights” with opposing presences. The moon guides how we measure our months, and it rules the ocean’s waves. It has served as a literary symbol or character since early times as well. The Greek and Roman goddesses Artemis and Diana were associated with the moon, giving it a feminine essence as opposed to the masculine sun gods. In Virgil’s *Aeneid*, the Greeks approached Troy “by the friendly silence of the quiet moon,” the single night in each cycle in which the moon is nearest to the sun and thus completely invisible.<sup>1</sup> Another iteration of the moon goddess is Selene in Greek and Luna in Latin. She was worshipped at each new and full moon, and is the subject of Homer’s *Hymn to Selene*.<sup>2</sup> The moon has also been a prominent character in German Romantic *Lieder*.<sup>3</sup> It often serves the role of watchman or guard over weary travelers, witness to those struggling or grieving, or mystical presence within the otherwise dark night.

This research will add to the growing body of knowledge surrounding topic theory, which was begun by Leonard G. Ratner, a former professor of Musicology at Stanford University, in his book, *Classic Music: Expression, Form, and Style*. Ratner defines and categorizes many principles of the rhetoric within the music of Classical composers such as Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven. He says, “Both language and music had their vocabulary, syntax, and arrangement of formal structures, subsumed under the title *Rhetoric*. The skilled composer, the well-trained performer, the perceptive listener

---

<sup>1</sup> Michael Ferber, *A Dictionary of Literary Symbols* (Cambridge University Press, 2007), p. 129.

<sup>2</sup> “Selene,” *Encyclopædia Britannica* (*Encyclopædia Britannica Inc.*, February 2018).

<sup>3</sup> Historically, the term *Lieder* could be applied to both poems and songs. However, all references to *Lieder* in this paper describe a song with vocal melody and piano accompaniment.

had command of musical rhetoric, much as a literate person today deals with the grammar of language.”<sup>4</sup>

Ratner’s work on topic theory has been developed by several other music theorists, including Kofi Agawu,<sup>5</sup> Robert Hatten,<sup>6</sup> and Raymond Monelle.<sup>7</sup> Erkii Huovinen and Anna-Kaisa Kaila define a musical topic, or topos, in their article “The Semantics of Musical Topoi: An Empirical Approach” as: “a set of musical entities, as delimited and coherently furnished with meaning by consistent trends of shared extramusical associations in a significant majority of a given listener population.”<sup>8</sup> Therefore, the topics used for moonlight must be recognizable by the majority of listeners as such, built up over centuries of using certain conventions to obtain the resulting topoi.

In his article, “‘Pierrot Lunaire’ as Lunar Nexus,” Michael Cherlin, Schoenberg scholar and Professor Emeritus at the University of Minnesota, divides literary passages about the moon’s symbolism in literature into thirteen distinct categories:

1. A guiding light
2. Barren, cold moon
3. Bloody moon
4. Fantasy and hallucination
5. Healing moon, blessed moon
6. Inconstancy
7. In the eye of the beholder
8. Intoxicating moonlight
9. Bittersweet love
10. Madness
11. Miraculous transformation
12. Sick moon
13. Uncanny moonlight<sup>9</sup>

---

<sup>4</sup> Leonard Ratner, *Classic Music: Expression, Form, and Style* (Macmillan Publishing Co., 1980), xiv.

<sup>5</sup> *Playing with Signs: A Semiotic Interpretation of Classic Music*, 1991.

<sup>6</sup> *Interpreting Musical Gestures, Topics, and Tropes: Mozart, Beethoven, Schubert*, 2004.

<sup>7</sup> *Musical Topic: Hunt, Military, and Pastoral*, 2006.

<sup>8</sup> Erkii Huovinen and Anna-Kaisa Kaila. “The Semantics of Musical Topoi: An Empirical Approach,” *Music Perception: An Interdisciplinary Approach* 33, no. 2 (December 2015): 220.

<sup>9</sup> Michael Cherlin, “‘Pierrot Lunaire’ as Lunar Nexus,” *Music Analysis* 31, no. 2 (July 2012): 177.

His Appendix A contains examples of various literary works for each of the thirteen categories, including authors such as Shakespeare, the Brothers Grimm, Friedrich Nietzsche, Heinrich Heine, and many others. Most *Lieder* fall under the categories “guiding light,” “healing moon, blessed moon,” and “bittersweet love.”

Cherlin also describes four musical topoi that accompany the moon topic: “‘flowing,’ ‘shimmering,’ ‘flickering,’ and ‘walking,’”<sup>10</sup> each of which he says may be found in Schubert’s many settings of moon-related *Lieder*, as well as in Schoenberg’s “Pierrot-Lunaire,” the main theme of his article. Cherlin concedes that the “walking” topic does not apply directly to the moon, rather that the moon has become the companion of the lonely night-time traveler, which is a common theme in nineteenth-century *Lieder*.

Sarah Clemmens Waltz, a music history professor at the University of the Pacific, calls the same “flowing” topos of steady triadic arpeggiation in the piano the “moonlight convention” in her article “In Defense of Moonlight.”<sup>11</sup> She also argues that this moonlight topic reflects a darker version of the pastoral topic, as described by Ratner in *Classic Style*, by using pastoral keys, slow harmonic movement, and frequent use of compound meter.<sup>12</sup> She claims that portrayals of the moon shifted from the Classical to the Romantic era. In the eighteenth century, moon poetry focused on “the moon’s secretive, changeable nature,” but by the late 1700s began “evolving from pastoral-idyllic to sublimely picturesque and from spiritually contemplative to spirit-haunted.”<sup>13</sup> Waltz’s last observation is that moonlight ultimately creates a liminal space in which there is

---

<sup>10</sup> Michael Cherlin, “‘Pierrot Lunaire’ as Lunar Nexus,” 178.

<sup>11</sup> Sarah Clemmens Waltz, “In Defense of Moonlight,” *Beethoven Forum* 14, no. 1 (Spring 2007): 15.

<sup>12</sup> Waltz, “In Defense of Moonlight,” 18.

<sup>13</sup> Waltz, 23.

more freedom between the physical and spiritual realms.<sup>14</sup> She describes what she calls the “moonlight convention,” a setting in the minor mode, slow harmonic movement, and a rolling eighth note pattern in an compound meter. She says this convention ties back to the Aeolian harp, mixing in spiritual attitudes with the dark pastoral *Stimmung* which so often accompanies moon songs.

One other element that appears in several moon songs of the nineteenth century is the idea of distance, whether that is found between the right and left hands of the piano accompaniment, between the piano and the voice, or in the key areas of the piece. Often, the song will modulate to a distantly related key upon a point of progression within the poetry.

---

<sup>14</sup> Waltz, 43.

Geuß, lieber Mond, geuß deine  
Silberflimmer  
Durch dieses Buchengrün,  
Wo Fantasein und Traumgestalten  
immer  
Vor mir vorüberfliehn!

Enthülle dich, daß ich die Stätte finde,  
Wo oft mein Mädchen saß,  
Und oft, im Wehn des Buchbaums und  
der Linde,  
Der goldnen Stadt vergaß!

Enthülle dich, daß ich des Strauchs mich  
freue,  
Der Kühlung ihr gerauscht,  
Und einen Kranz auf jeden Anger streue,  
Wo sie den Bach belauscht!

Dann, lieber Mond, dann nimm den  
Schleier wieder,  
Und traur' um deinen Freund,  
Und weine durch den Wolkenflor  
hernieder,  
Wie dein Verlaßner weint!

Pour, dear moon, pour your silver glitter  
down through the greenery of beeches,  
where phantasms and dream-shapes  
are always floating before me!

Reveal yourself, that I may find the  
place  
where my darling often sat,  
and often forgot, in the wind of beech  
and linden trees,  
the golden city.

Reveal yourself, that I may enjoy the  
bushes  
which swept coolness to her,  
and that I may lay a wreath upon that  
pasture  
where she listened to the brook.

Then, dear moon, then take up your veil  
again,  
and mourn your friend,  
and weep through the clouds  
as one abandoned weeps!

**Example 1.1: Ludwig Heinrich Christoph Hölty, “An den Mond”**



A song which uses the moonlight convention in a typical fashion is Franz Schubert's "An den Mond" ("To the Moon") (D. 193, 1815, poem by Ludwig Christoph Heinrich Hölty), which fits under Cherlin's literary category of "A guiding light." Cherlin describes how the piano clearly depicts the "flowing" topos, which appears in the rolling triplets in the right hand of the accompaniment. The setting is quite reminiscent of Beethoven's "Moonlight Sonata" (a prime example of Waltz's "moonlight convention"), with which Schubert would have been familiar. The speaker in the poem is mourning the loss of a beloved and asks the moon to shine light on the places where he/she once sat and listened to the brook, which matches the dream-like melancholia present in Beethoven's work as well. The constancy of the triadic gesture also corroborates the "flowing" topic, as the perseverance of the motive maps onto the steadfastness of the moon as guiding light (Example 1.2).

Singstimme  
Orig. F moll

Pianoforte

Geuß,

lie - - ber Mond, geuß dei - ne Sil - berflimmer durch die - - ses Bu - - chen-

grün, wo Phan - ta - si - en und Traum - gestal - ten

**Example 1.2: Franz Schubert, “An den Mond,” mm. 1-9**

A poem that depicts the moon as “healing” and “blessed” is Heinrich Heine’s “Nacht liegt auf dem fremden Wegen” (“Night lies on the unfamiliar roads”, 1827). This was set by Brahms and entitled “Mondenschein” (“Moonshine”) (Op. 85, no. 2, 1878). The beginning of the poem depicts a lonesome traveler, with what may be observed as a “walking” motive in the piano (slow, plodding quarter notes). The third and fourth line of the first stanza read, “Ah, like a quiet blessing, there flows down, sweet moon, your light” (Example 1.3, mm. 10-15).

der; — Ach, da fließt, wie stil - ler Se - gen,

*m.s.* *m.d.* *dolcissimo*

12 sü - ßer Mond, dein Licht her - nie - der; sü - ßer Mond, mit dei - nen Strah - len

J. B. 158

**Example 1.3: Johannes Brahms, “Mondenschein,” mm. 8-15**

As soon as the poetry (full text in Example 1.4) shifts focus from the traveler’s tired limbs to the moon’s sweet light (Example 1.3, m. 10), the flowing topos begins and remains consistent throughout the song. In this musical setting, the right hand of the piano line arpeggiates a chord almost two octaves before floating back down to mid-range in a more stepwise manner. This pattern continues until the last two lines of the song, which state, “Away runs my pain, and my eyes brim over with tears.” At this point, after a brief cessation of motion, the piano begins a new pattern of triplets in the left hand against eighth notes in the right, perhaps mimicking the flow of the moonlight (the steady eighths) with the triplets representing the quicker flow of tears. Clearly, this “flowing” topos applies to the moon under circumstances in which the moon is seen as a guiding or healing companion.

Nacht liegt auf den fremden Wegen,  
Krankes Herz und müde Glieder; -  
Ach, da fließt, wie stiller Segen,  
Süßer Mond, dein Licht hernieder;

Night lies on the unfamiliar roads;  
a sick heart and tired limbs...  
ah, like a quiet blessing, there flows  
down,  
sweet moon, your light;

Süßer Mond, mit deinen Strahlen  
Scheuchest du das nächt'ge Grauen;  
Es zerrinnen meine Qualen,  
Und die Augen übertauen.

Sweet moon, with your rays  
You drive away the night horror;  
Away runs my pain,  
And my eyes brim over with tears.

**Example 1.4: Heinrich Heine, “Nacht liegt auf den fremden Wegen”<sup>15</sup>**

Fanny Mendelssohn-Hensel’s setting of “Die Mainacht” (Op. posth. 9, no. 6) by Ludwig Heinrich Christoph Hölty also utilizes this flowing motive in the piano line. This poem (full text in Example 1.5) falls under the “bittersweet love” category, portraying the lonely walk through the woods of a protagonist recognizing that the nightingale and the doves have partners with whom to share their nest, while the speaker is living a solitary existence. Each strophe of the song moves its focus, first from the silver moon shining light into the woods, then to the nightingale, happy with his beloved in their nest, to the pair of doves. At the end of the third stanza, a single tear flows down the face of the speaker, as he or she “turn[s] away seeking darker shadows” (Example 1.6, m. 10). It is as if the flowing light of the moon, which undergirds the entirety of the song in the piano part, is a source of pain for the speaker, who wishes to be alone in the darkness.

---

<sup>15</sup> Translation by Emily Ezust at Lieder.net: [https://www.lieder.net/lieder/get\\_text.html?TextId=7634](https://www.lieder.net/lieder/get_text.html?TextId=7634).

Wann der silberne Mond durch die  
Gesträuche blinkt,  
Und sein schlummerndes Licht über den  
Rasen streut,  
Und die Nachtigall flötet,  
Wandl' ich traurig von Busch zu  
Busch.

Selig preis' ich dich dann, flötende  
Nachtigall,  
Weil dein Weibchen mit dir wohnt in  
Einem Nest,  
Ihrem singenden Gatten  
Tausend trauliche Küsse giebt.

Überhüllet von Laub, girret ein  
Taubenpaar  
Sein Entzücken mir vor; aber ich wende  
mich,  
Suche dunklere Schatten,  
Und die einsame Thräne rinnt.

When the silver moon twinkles through  
the bushes,  
And dusts the grass with its sleepy light,  
And the nightingale pipes like a flute,  
I wander mournfully from bush to bush.

I call you blessed then, fluting  
nightingale,  
For your beloved lives with you in one  
nest,  
And gives her singing spouse  
A thousand loving kisses.

Surrounded with leaves, a pair of doves  
coos  
Their delight to me, but I turn away,  
Seeking darker shadows,  
And a solitary tear flows.

**Example 1.5: Ludwig Heinrich Christoph Hölty, “Die Mainacht”<sup>16</sup>**

---

<sup>16</sup> Translation by Emily Ezust at Lieder.net: [https://www.lieder.net/lieder/get\\_text.html?TextId=129677](https://www.lieder.net/lieder/get_text.html?TextId=129677).

1. Ra - - - sen streut: und die Nach - - - ti - gall  
 2. wen - - - de mich, su - che dunk - - - le - re

12

1. flö - - tet, wandl' ich trau - - - rig von Busch zu Busch, wandl' ich  
 2. Schat - - ten, und die ein - - - sa - - me Thrä - - ne rinnt, und die

*p* *cresc.* *f*

**Example 1.6: Fanny Mendelssohn-Hensel, “Die Mainacht,” mm. 9-14**

Another song within the category of “bittersweet love” is Heinrich Heine’s “Die Lotosblume” (1823), which was set to music by Robert Schumann (Op. 33 no. 3), among many others. Schumann’s setting is strictly devoid of the “flowing” topic so prevalent in other moon *Lieder*. Instead, the piano accompaniment plays steady quarter notes in  $\frac{6}{4}$  time. This steadiness does not portray the “walking” motif, as the tempo is too fast and that interpretation is not fitting with the text. Instead, while the majority of the song is about the lotus and her actions and feelings, when the moon enters the scene it is accompanied by a shift to the  $\flat$ VI chord, from F major to D-flat major (Example 1.7, m. 10). This may be to illustrate the distance of the moon: In “Der Lotosblume,” the moon must journey around the earth overnight in order to meet his love the lotus. The modulation also occurs at the awakening of the lotus, mapping the key progression onto the poetic progression.



**Example 1.7: Robert Schumann, “Die Lotosblume,” mm. 8-11**

Another work which forgoes the “flowing” theme of moon *Lieder* is Schumann’s “Mond, meiner Seele Liebling” (“Moon, Beloved of my Soul”) (op. 104, 1851, poem by Elisabeth Kulmann). This song seems to fall under the category of “sick moon,” or perhaps “barren, cold moon.” The speaker begins by asking the moon why she is so pale today. She asks if one of her children or her spouse the sun are unwell. The moon serves as a source of consolation for the protagonist, whose own mother is gravely ill. The final strophe is as follows:

May the sight of you, moon, be a comfort to me;  
I do not suffer alone:  
You are the co-regent of the world,  
And you too cannot always be happy!<sup>17</sup>

The song is in G minor until the beginning of this stanza, when it modulates to the parallel G major (Example 1.8, m. 26). While the moon and the protagonist of the poem both seem to be struggling, the speaker is simply glad to know she is not alone. While in other poems involving the moon refer to it as a guide or helper, in this poem Kulmann recognizes the *moon’s* feelings and suffering, giving it more character than other poets.

---

<sup>17</sup> Translation provided by Sharon Krebs on Lieder.net:  
[http://www.lieder.net/lieder/get\\_text.html?TextId=9701](http://www.lieder.net/lieder/get_text.html?TextId=9701).

Perhaps this blatant anthropomorphization of the moon is one of the reasons why Schumann so clearly steered away from other tropes used in depictions of the moon.

ih - rer Ruh'! Trost sei mir, Mond, dein Anblick, ich lei - de nicht al - lein: du  
 30  
 bist der Welt Mit - herrscher, und kannst nicht stets dich freu'n!

**Example 1.8: Robert Schumann, “Mond, meine Seele Liebling,” mm. 24-36**

These examples demonstrate several typical uses of the moonlight topos. The rest of this paper will turn to deeper analyses of two Klopstock poems (“Die Sommernacht” and “Die frühen Gräber”) that were each set to music by Christoph Gluck, Franz Schubert, and Fanny Hensel. Gluck’s settings portray a “naïve” reading of the poetry and Hensel displays a “sentimental” reading of the poems, whereas Schubert straddles a middle ground, giving hints of “sentimentality” within a more broadly “naïve” approach.

### **Friedrich Schiller: Naïve versus Sentimental**

In his essay entitled “On Naïve and Sentimental Poetry,” Friedrich Schiller, a philosopher from the late eighteenth century, describes how ancient (“naïve”) poetry imitated nature as closely as possible, while “sentimental” poetry revealed the deeper



imperfection of man and his disconnection with the natural world. Schiller states, “So it appears, that the end toward which man strives through culture, is infinitely superior to that which he attains through nature. The one receives its value, therefore, through absolute attainment of a finite, the other obtains it through the approach to an infinite greatness.”<sup>18</sup> He explains that, while naïve poetry seeks only to explain nature as it exists, the importance of the sentimental is its reach to describe beyond what is seen.

Hilliard T. Goldfarb explains that to understand Schiller one must first understand the Kantian background within which he was operating. Kant explored the idea of “the relationship between the mind, considered as an abstract and absolute existence, and Nature, experienced as the manifold world of sense perceptions.”<sup>19</sup> How humans respond to Nature is what Schiller tackled in his treatise. He begins by discussing how, from childhood, we often experience a deep love and touching respect of nature, out of an interest which often elevates itself to a need within us. Schiller states, “First, it is entirely necessary, that the object which infuses us with the same, be *nature* or certainly be held by us therefore: second, that it (in the broadest meaning of the word) be *naïve*, i.e., that nature stand in contrast with art and shame her. So soon as the last is added to the first, and not before, nature is changed into the naïve.”<sup>20</sup> Therefore, according to Schiller, the “naïve” poet follows directly in the simplicity of nature, restricted to imitating the real world.

In his article, “Schiller and the Genesis of Romanticism,” Arthur O. Lovejoy summarizes the move from “naïve” in this way:

---

<sup>18</sup> Friedrich Schiller, *On Naïve and Sentimental Poetry*, 1795, 13.

<sup>19</sup> Hilliard T. Goldfarb, “Defining ‘Naïve and Sentimental’ Landscape: Schiller, Hackert, Koch, and the Romantic Experience,” *The Bulletin of the Cleveland Museum of Art* 69, no. 9 (November 1982): 282.

<sup>20</sup> Friedrich Schiller, *On Naïve and Sentimental Poetry*, 1.

the modern poet, in contrast with the ancient, is characteristically “subjective,” disposed to be interested rather “in the impression which objects make upon him than in the objects themselves”; that the “ancient poet moves us through Nature, through the truth of sense, through a present and living reality, while the modern poet moves us through ideas.”<sup>21</sup>

Lovejoy argues that the significance of Schiller’s work is that, instead of analyzing modern (“sentimental”) poetry as degenerating from the times of the ancient poets, he elevates modern expressions of art as “an infinite superiority in kind” to their “naïve” predecessors.<sup>22</sup> This path taken by modern (“sentimental”) poets, of striving to obtain the ideal, is one which the human race and each individual follows, therefore it is to be revered above the ancient ways.<sup>23</sup>

What is the motivation of the “sentimental” poet? Schiller states that he is “always concerned with two conflicting conceptions and feelings, with reality as limit and with his idea as the infinite, and the mixed feeling, which he arouses, will always testify to this two-fold source.”<sup>24</sup> Therefore, the “sentimental” poet is concerned with this space of tension, in which nature is observed and respected, however there is a deeper sense of irony by which the poet is at the same time not satisfied with what he has found in this space. A sense of loss results, revealing itself either as either *satirical* by dwelling on the contradiction of reality with the ideal, or *elegiac* by “opposing nature to art and the ideal to the real, that the representation of the first predominates and the pleasure in the same becomes the ruling feeling.”<sup>25</sup>

---

<sup>21</sup> Arthur O. Lovejoy, “Schiller and the Genesis of Romanticism, Part II,” *Modern Language Notes* 35, no. 3 (March 1920): 139.

<sup>22</sup> Lovejoy, 139.

<sup>23</sup> Lovejoy, 139.

<sup>24</sup> Schiller, *On Naïve and Sentimental Poetry*, 14.

<sup>25</sup> Schiller, 17.

Schiller's discussion of "naïve" versus "sentimental" is reflected in the shift from the Classical period into the Romantic period. While "classic" poetry was defined by Friedrich Schlegel as objectively beautiful and limited in its scope, he deemed "romantic" poetry as overstepping boundaries and expressing deep longing. His terms became adopted to describe the cultural shift that occurred around the turn of the nineteenth century.<sup>26</sup> Driven by rapid advancements in science and technology, Schlegel claimed that society at this time sought in many ways to return to ideas of myth, dreams, and the supernatural, turning to "common folk" as the true representation of their nation. A turn toward individualism and looking to nature was in direct confrontation of the industrial revolution, which was bringing more and more people into the city centers. The dichotomies between the Classical and Romantic periods are clear in the musical outcomes of the times. Classical music is simple, natural, and straightforward, while the shift toward Romantic music brought with it a new form of expression, individualism, and originality which may be associated with Schiller's idea of the "sentimental."

Schiller used the terms "naïve" and "sentimental" to classify two types of poetry and poets, but they may also be utilized to analyze the musical setting of a poem, to understand the approach that the poet *and* the composer have given to the original poem. Within *Lieder* regarding the moon, this approach may uncover a revelation about death or a sadness from being removed from loved ones, as the moon's distance from the earth often gives way to remarks upon another form of distance. Following Schiller's characterization of "sentimental" poetry, this paper aims to uncover the "sentimental" within Fanny Hensel's composition, "Die Sommernacht," (written in 1827) as well as

---

<sup>26</sup> J. Peter Burkholder, Donald Jay Grout, Claude V. Palisca. "The Romantic Generation: Song and Piano Music." *A History of Western Music*. (W. W. Norton: 2014): 594.

Klopstock's original poem of the same name (published in 1766). I will reveal an unusual way Hensel used the moonlight topic to fulfill her reading of Klopstock's poetry.

### **Three Settings of Klopstock's "Die Sommernacht"**

Klopstock's poetry (Example 1.9) follows a specific progression, beginning cheerfully and wistfully, speaking of the moon flowing down into the wood while the aromas of the linden trees waft about. The second strophe turns toward thoughts of the grave, and with it a lack of light and no more scents from the surrounding plants. The third stanza reminisces on how the speaker once enjoyed these same woods with those who are no longer alive, and just how beautiful the nature was in those moments.

Wenn der Schimmer von dem Monde  
nun herab  
In die Wälder sich ergießt, und Gerüche  
Mit den Düften von der Linde  
In den Kühlungen wehn;

So umschatten mich Gedanken an das  
Grab  
Der Geliebten, und ich seh' in dem  
Walde  
Nur es dämmern, und es weht mir  
Von der Blüthe nicht her.

Ich genoß einst, o ihr Todten, es mit  
euch!  
Wie umwehten uns der Duft und die  
Kühlung,  
Wie verschönt warst von dem Monde,  
Du, o schöne Natur!

When the gleam of the moon now flows  
down  
on the wood, and the scents  
in the breezes from the linden trees  
blow in the coolness:

So shadows surround my thoughts of the  
grave  
of my beloved, and I see in the wood  
only twilight, and the breezes do not  
send me scents from the blossoms.

I enjoyed it once with you, O Dead ones!  
How the scents and the cool breezes  
blew about us,  
how beautiful the moon was,  
and you, O fair Nature!

### Example 1.9: Friedrich Gottlieb Klopstock, “Die Sommernacht”<sup>27</sup>

Schiller speaks in detail about this type of poetry which he calls “elegiac.” He states, “The elegiac poet seeks nature, but as an idea and in a perfection, in which it has never existed, although he weeps over it as something that has existed and now is lost.”<sup>28</sup> He speaks particularly of the German poets Haller, Kleist, and Klopstock in saying,

They move us through ideas, not through sensuous truth, not so much because they themselves are nature, as because they know how to enthuse us for nature. What, however, is true in general of the character of these, as well as of all sentimental poets, does not of course exclude in any way the capability to move us in particular through naïve beauty: without this, they would not be poets overall. It is only not their proper and prevailing character, to receive with a calm, simple, and easy sense and to represent in the same manner, that which is received. . . . We receive in this way never the object, only what the reflecting understanding of the poet made from the object, and even then, if the poet himself

---

<sup>27</sup> Translation by Emily Ezust at Lieder.net: [http://www.lieder.net/lieder/get\\_text.html?TextId=9443](http://www.lieder.net/lieder/get_text.html?TextId=9443).

<sup>28</sup> Schiller, *On Naïve and Sentimental Poetry*, 18.

is this object, if he wishes to represent his feelings, we do not experience his condition immediately and at first hand, but rather as the same is reflected in his soul, what he has thought about it as spectator of himself.<sup>29</sup>

The idea of being spectator of oneself speaks to the importance of the shift from description of what is seen to description of what is felt by the poet. In this particular poem, Klopstock begins with a “naïve” perception of the protagonist alone in the woods. However, it is quickly revealed that the speaker is not happy to be in this place which once gave him or her so much joy, as they are no longer accompanied by their loved one, with whom this beautiful scene had been shared in the past.

While Christoph Willibald Gluck was mainly known for his operas, he composed several songs, the majority of which are found in *Klopstocks Oden und Lieder bey dem Clavier zu Singen* (published in 1786), in which his setting of “Die Sommernacht” appears as the fifth song (of seven total). Many scholars have remarked upon the simplicity of these odes, which may have been due to the nature of the Lied at that time. In his essay, “The Eighteenth-Century Lied,” James Parsons explains that “German verse set to music in the eighteenth century was designed for immediate consumption and enjoyment.”<sup>30</sup> While Italian opera was viewed as an upper class artform, Parsons quotes the publisher Koch in saying that “the genre [is] the one product of music and poetry whose content today appeals to *every* class of people and *every* individual.”<sup>31</sup>

In her essay entitled “The Lieder of Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach, Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven,” Amanda Glauert explains, “Schiller distinguished between ‘naïve artists

---

<sup>29</sup> Schiller, 19.

<sup>30</sup> James Parsons, “The Eighteenth-Century Lied,” *The Cambridge Companion to the Lied* (Cambridge University Press: 2004), 60.

<sup>31</sup> Parsons, “The Eighteenth-Century Lied,” 60.

who could *be* nature, and ‘sentimental artists who *sought* nature.’<sup>32</sup> She uses Mozart’s setting of “Sehnsucht nach der Frühling” as an illustration of the “naïve,” in that “for all the notion of yearning (“Sehnsucht”) in the title, Mozart’s melody makes it seem as though spring had fully arrived, as part of an eternal present.”<sup>33</sup> Gluck presents a similar attitude in his settings of Klopstock, that while there may be a deeper meaning in many of the poems, Gluck seems to take them at face value, maintaining a simplicity that is not evident in the settings of Schubert and Hensel.

---

<sup>32</sup> Amanda Glauert, “The Lieder of Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach, Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven,” *The Cambridge Companion to the Lied*. (Cambridge University Press: 2004), 74.

<sup>33</sup> Glauert, “The Lieder of Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach...,” 74.

1. Wenn der Schim - - mer von dem Mon - - - de / nun her -  
 2. So um - schat - - ten mich Ge - dan - - - ken / an das  
 3. Ich ge - noss - - - einst, o ihr Tod - - - - ten, es mit

3

ab - - - in die Wül - - - der sich er - giesst, und Ge -  
 Grab - - - der Ge - lieb - - - ten, und ich sch' in dem  
 euch! - - - Wie um - weh - - - ten uns der Duft und die

6

rü - - - che mit den Duf - - - ten von der Lin - - - de in den  
 Wal - - - de nur es däm - - - mern, und es weht - - - mir von der  
 Küh - - - lung! Wie ver - schönt - - - warst von dem Mon - - - de du, o

9

Küh - - - lun - gen wehn,  
 Blü - - - the nicht her.  
 schö - - - ne Na - tur!

*Fine.*  
*Da Capo.*

### Example 1.10: Christoph Willibald Gluck, “Die Sommernacht”

Gluck approaches Klopstock’s “Die Sommernacht” with a strophic setting in C minor. The harmony toggles between tonic and dominant until halfway through the strophe in m. 5, which introduces the first instance of subdominant harmony with iv<sup>6</sup>



leading directly back to V and  $i^6$  in mm. 6–7 (Example 1.10). The piece closes with  $ii^{06}$  preceding the final cadence:  $i_4^6$ ,  $V^7$ ,  $i$  in mm. 8–10. The simplicity of the chord progressions mirrors the way in which Gluck views the poetry. Something of note is the harmonic movement of the song: there is either one chord per bar, or there is a brief insertion of a new chord in the final beat of the measure, before beginning a new chord on the downbeat of the next. This is not a direct quotation of a moon topic; however, the slow harmonic motion gives the piece a sense of lilt and sobriety, similar in character to many other songs about the moon.

Another musical feature which is not an exact moon topic, yet correlates to a topic, is Gluck's flowing eighth notes in the accompaniment. The only time this pattern is broken occurs at the very end of each strophe (LH of m. 9 in Example 1.10), with a quarter note on the third beat, then jumping right back into the eighth-note device that transitions into the next strophe (mm. 10–11). However, directly before a new strophe begins, the piano finally pauses on a cadential  $\frac{5}{4}$  for an entire half note in m. 12 (which resolves to  $V_3^5$  in the final beat of the measure), leaving the listener with a sense of anticipation for the restart of the strophe.

In the vocal line, the melody hovers around  $\hat{5}$  until leaping up to  $\hat{1}$  in m. 3 and  $\hat{3}$  in m. 4. From that point, the melody follows a generic 3–2–1 line that matches the simplicity of the aforementioned straightforward harmonic motion. This is also mirrored by the nested third progression in mm. 7–9. The apex of the song occurs in the penultimate measure of each strophe, on F5, before a final descent from E $\flat$  to C, embedding a small 3–2–1 line within the larger structure of the *Urlinie*. Also, the pace of

the melodic movement seems to depict the wind softly blowing through the trees in the forest. This direct depiction of nature is quintessential to Schiller's ideal of the "naïve."

The simplicity of the melody helps to maintain the quiet, slightly uneasy *Stimmung* that remains unchanged throughout the entirety of the song. The running eighth notes in the piano, harmonic rhythm, and simple melody all contribute to a very basic interpretation of a poem that weaves between admiring the stillness of nature through the lens of the moonlight and mourning the fact that the speaker is here alone instead of with their beloved.

To many scholars, Schubert is known as the father of the *Lied*. Many of his songs have become famous representatives of the genre, including "Erlkönig," "Der Doppelgänger," and "Wandrer's Nachtlied." According to Marie-Agnes Dittrich in her essay, "The Lieder of Schubert," several of Schubert's songs before 1816 were hybrids between the *Lied* and the *Gesänge*, a more lengthy and dramatic form of song. She also states that Schubert may have been influenced by Mozart and Beethoven in his use of recitative.<sup>34</sup> In his setting of "Die Sommernacht" (D. 289, 1815), Schubert begins by setting the first two strophes of the poem in recitative, clearly drawing inspiration from opera. As Dittrich states, "The traditional use of recitative within operas, oratorios, and cantatas generally signals the arrival of a new situation or of comparatively stronger emotions and, as such, makes possible a contrast in affect."<sup>35</sup> She also mentions that after around 1816, Schubert was more likely to merge recitative-like elements, creating a greater sense of uniformity in his songs.<sup>36</sup>

---

<sup>34</sup> Marie-Agnes Dittrich, "The Lieder of Schubert," in *The Cambridge Companion to the Lied* (Cambridge University Press: 2004): 92.

<sup>35</sup> Dittrich, "The Lieder of Schubert," 92.

<sup>36</sup> Dittrich, 93.

Singstimme.

Pianoforte.

Wenn der Schimmer von dem

5

Mon.de nun her.ab auf die Wälder sich er - giesst,

7

und Ge.rü.che mit den Düf.ten von der Lin.de in den Küh.lun.gen wehn:

9

so um.schat.ten mich Ge.dan-ken an das Grab mei - ner Ge.

**Example 1.11: Franz Schubert, “Die Sommernacht,” mm. 1-10**

Schubert utilizes the recitative format for his setting of “Die Sommernacht,” seemingly creating a short operetta out of Klopstock’s poem. The piece begins with a three-measure opening in the piano in C major (Example 1.11). From there, the voice takes over with running sixteenth notes for two measures, as is expected in recitative in order to reproduce the sound of the speaking voice. The piano and voice alternate between small fragments of one to two measures until the end of the second strophe of

poetry in m. 14 (Example 1.12). Surprisingly, Schubert begins the third stanza of poetry in m. 16 by repeating a portion of the first line, “Ich genoss es einst mit euch,” (“I enjoyed it once with you,” originally “Ich genoß einst, o ihr Todten, es mit euch!”), Then repeated twice in another partial form: Ich genoß einst, es mit euch! Ich genoß einst, es mit euch! This portion of the song serves as the segue between the recitative and the final “aria” component beginning in m. 15.

lieb-ten, und ich seh' im Walde nur es dämmern, und es  
 14 weht mir von der Blüthen nicht her. Ich ge-noss einst, o ihr  
 18 To-dten, ich genoss es einst mit euch, ich ge-noss es einst mit euch!  
 21 Wie um-weh-ten uns der Duft und die Küh-lung, wie ver-schönt warst von dem  
 24 Mon-de-du, o schöne Na-tur!

**Example 1.12: Franz Schubert, “Die Sommernacht,” 11-26**

The aria section at the very end of the piece (mm. 15-26, Example 1.12) seems to pick up on a few typical moon themes. Instead of remaining in C major, this section transitions into (and back out of) A minor. The steady quarter notes in the bass with a

consistent three-sixteenth note pattern in the right hand follow a type of flowing pattern, and the harmony is more settled along with the rhythm. There is a bit of play with A $\flat$  and F $\sharp$ , otherwise the pianissimo accompaniment is firmly resting on tonic while the singer continues with the final lines of the third strophe (mm. 21-25): “Wie umwehtens uns der Duft und die Kühlung, wie verschönt warst von dem Monde du, o schöne Natur!” (“How enveloping was the smell and the cooling [breezes], how beautiful were you from the moon, oh lovely nature!”). The melodic line floats around scale degrees  $\hat{3}$  and  $\hat{4}$ , finally landing on tonic at the very end of the song. This passage, while the most at peace, also evokes a sense of longing for the past, perhaps even reaching for it and falling away with each melodic F that falls back to E.

While in the rest of this section the A $\flat$ s and F $\sharp$ s are played separately in the piano, producing mode mixture and a  $V_2^4$  of V respectively, they converge in a German augmented 6th chord in the penultimate measure. In this way, what were chromatic hints of melancholy and the feeling of being out of place come together to produce a twinge of unrest before the authentic cadence on tonic to end the piece. These musical details convey an understanding of that deep longing and loneliness which occur within the poetry, but it is only through these few hints at the close of the song. As a whole, this song presents as a very slight, compact operetta, in which the singer narrates through the motion of the poetry, then lands on a more melancholic *Stimmung* for the final six measures.

**Largo maestoso**

Wann der Schim - mer von dem

Mon - de nun her - ab in die Wäl - der sich er -

gießt, und Ge - rü - che mit den Duf - ten von der

**Example 1.13: Fanny Hensel, “Die Sommernacht,” mm. 1-8**

Fanny Hensel’s setting of “Die Sommernacht” (written September 12, 1827) is set in a rounded binary form (ABA’), and uses what Cherlin describes as the flowing topic, but with a twist. Instead of consistent eighth notes outlining triads, Hensel has set the piece in  $\frac{9}{8}$  time, with the first two beats of the accompaniment following this pattern, but the last pausing on a dotted quarter note (Example 1.13). Until the final six measures, this

pattern is only broken one time in m.10 (Example 1.14), in which there are constant eighth notes. This pause at the end of every measure interrupts the otherwise flowing topic, potentially reflecting the loss of light found in the B section of the song (mm. 12-21). Perhaps it represents the moon being covered by a cloud, or invisible through the thick foliage in the wood. This lack of light is mirrored in the loss of the speaker's beloved, as she wanders the woods without the company of her love and others who have passed.

9

Lin - de in den Küh - lung - en wehn; so um -

12

schat - ten mich Ge - dan - ken an das Grab der Ge -

15

lieb - ten, und ich seh' in dem Wal - de nur es

Example 1.14: Fanny Hensel, “Die Sommernacht,” mm. 9-17



18 *dim.* *ritard.* *p*  
 däm - mern, und es weht mir von der Blü - te nicht

21 *a tempo* *f*  
 her. Ich ge - noß einst, O ihr

24 *dim.*  
 To - ten, es mit euch! Wie um - weh - ten uns der

Example 1.15: Fanny Hensel, “Die Sommernacht,” mm. 18-26

The pause in the piano is also the point at which the speaker enters, each time (until the end of the song) with the rhythm of a quarter note plus an eighth note, often as the beginning of a descending line. This moment of interchange between the piano and voice may also represent the loneliness the protagonist is feeling, as even the moon has become an inconstant figure in her life (Example 1.15).

The progression of the poetry is reflected in Hensel's song. She begins in the pastoral key of F major, with the lilting pattern in the piano and a descending line in the voice. The first truly chromatic chord appears on the word "Linde," (lime tree) in m. 9, which is a well-known symbol of lovers, as it was often used as a meeting place for them.<sup>37</sup> The  $\flat VII^6$  chord is followed by a secondary dominant of ii, ending this A section on a  $ii:HC$  in m. 10 (Example 1.14). Perhaps this chromaticism and unstable ending is already an indication that something has gone awry at the lovers' former meeting place.

The B section (mm. 12-21, Example 1.14 and 1.15), corresponding with the second strophe, begins in G minor then moves to  $vii^{\circ 6}_5$  of D in m. 14, holding out on that harmony before shifting to  $V^4_2$  of D in m. 18, and finally landing in D minor in m. 19. However, instead of cadencing there, the harmony continues on to  $V^7$  of A before cadencing in A major to end the B section (Example 1.14, m. 21). This ends the second section with yet another pseudo-half cadence ( $V:PAC$ ), just as in the first section. However, the tonal irregularity and lack of stability signify the loss felt by the speaker. The first fully diminished chord appears on the word "Grab" (grave), coloring the dark turn of the poetry appropriately. However, the irony begins at the  $V:PAC$  which finishes the section, as the words are decidedly negative. The protagonist mourns the fact that the fragrance from the flowers is no longer present, while this is the first stable major cadence of the piece. Perhaps Hensel is already in remembrance-mode, thinking of the flowers when they *did* share their scent.

After this cadence, the third stanza begins with a modified return of the A section. This repeat of material from the beginning of the song indicates a remembrance of the

---

<sup>37</sup> A.T. Hatto, "The Lime-Tree and Early German, Goliard and English Lyric Poetry," *The Modern Language Review* 49, no. 2 (April 1954): 194.

earlier days when the speaker was joined in this setting by her loved ones who have died. The poetry comes full circle, back to how the moon made the natural surroundings so beautiful as fragrances blew all around her and the loved ones from her past. The constancy of the flowing motive again represents the moon's constant light, even though in difficult times it may appear to be far off or too dim. The completion of the motive occurs during the last two lines in the poetry, as the piano continues to pause on the third beat of each measure, but in m. 24 the voice fully picks up on the pattern, singing three eighth notes instead of the previous quarter-eighth figure (Example 1.15). Therefore, what appears to be a simple embellishment of the A section demonstrates the moon shining brighter than ever in the speaker's memory.

27 *cresc.* *f* *poco ritenuto*  
Duft und die Küh - lung, wie\_\_ ver - schönt warst von\_ dem

30 *dim.* *p*  
Mon - de, du,\_\_\_ o schö - ne Na - tur!

33 *cresc.* *f* *pp*

Example 1.16: Fanny Hensel, “Die Sommernacht,” mm. 27-36

One other fascinating element to this piece is the lack of  $\hat{3}$  in the vocal line. At the beginning of the song, the voice descends note-by-note over an octave, skipping only A within the F major scale (Example 1.13). When A does appear in m. 6 it is an accented passing tone above a  $V^7$ , and in m. 10 it ends the second stanza, but is supported by  $V/ii$ . The B section also ends with A in the voice, supported by the strange cadence in A major, a distantly related key to F major. Upon the restart of the first line of the A section (beginning in m. 22), A does appear in the downward scale, supported by a  $IV_4^6$  chord, then again in m. 27 above a  $V^7$ , and a final time as an escape tone in m. 29 over a  $I^6$ .

(Example 1.16). The seemingly purposeful exclusion of  $\hat{3}$  may reflect the loss that the speaker feels, perhaps even thinking of the things she left unsaid to her loved ones before their passing. However, the A appears as the apex of the piano line ending the piece, paying homage to what was omitted elsewhere, recognizing what was lost (Example 1.16). This A still appears above a vi chord instead of I, intimating the twinge that the speaker feels in her solitary state.

Klopstock's poem seamlessly blends the natural world with the elegiac style explained by Schiller. Fanny Hensel follows suit with her seemingly simple beginning, which hints at the darker meaning lurking in the rest of the poetry through the twisted use of the moon motive, the lack of  $\hat{3}$  in the vocal line, and the unexpected half cadence which ends the section. This points to an understanding of the "sentimental" nature of the poem, and a setting which matches those emotions.

Another element of the sentimental which Hensel seems to have incorporated is what Sarah Clemmens Waltz refers to as "the dark pastoral." The use of F major, a generally regarded pastoral key, is offset by G minor and D minor within the middle of the song, whose major counterparts are also typical pastoral tonalities. The use of compound meter, minus the addition of the halting figure in the piano, is also common in the pastoral topic with a darkness injected into the song, creating a "silver space," a term also coined by Waltz,<sup>38</sup> which saves the protagonist from having to imagine a completely black, moonless night.

These three settings of Klopstock's "*Die Sommernacht*" provide examples of how both moon topoi and Schiller's ideals of the "naïve" and "sentimental" evolved over time.

---

<sup>38</sup> Sarah Clemmens Waltz, "In Defense of Moonlight," 18.

Gluck's setting is consistently simple and straightforward, not producing much nuance or even a sense of loss in response to the elegiac nature of the poetry. Schubert has constructed a small operetta out of the poem, with a more typical use of the moon topic in the final few measures of the song. His setting displays greater evidence of understanding the broader *Stimmung* of the poetry, both through his use of the moon topic and through a more generally melancholic setting, with chromaticism at times of pain in the poetry. Fanny Hensel provides several clues that portray the deeper sense of longing felt in the poetry. Through her altered use of the "flowing" moon topic she brings a sense of lilting to the poetry, and each pause in the music causes the listener to reflect upon the pause that the speaker must feel in her loneliness. The shift from "naïve" to "sentimental" is felt clearly in the span of time from Gluck's setting in 1786 to Hensel's in 1827.

### **Three Settings of Klopstock's "Die frühen Gräber"**

Klopstock's poem, "Die frühen Gräber" (1764, Example 1.17), begins similarly to "Die Sommernacht," with the speaker addressing the moon, then shifting into remembering a time when the "nobler ones" were present, and all was happy. This moon represents the "guiding light" as explained by Michael Cherlin, as it is treasured by the speaker as a helpful guide, and "friend of thought" (*Gedankenfreund*, a term coined by Klopstock) in the third line of the first strophe. This stanza also has the speaker announce his fears of the moon leaving ("Du entfliehst? Eile nicht, bleib") ("You flee? Hurry not, stay"). The clouds were simply moving across the night sky, temporarily masking the moon's light, but it uncovers a deeper fear of abandonment felt by the speaker. The second strophe narrates the "awakening" of May and depicts the moon as reddish coming up over the hill ("Und zu dem Hügel herauf röthlich er kommt"). The final stanza refers

to those who have died, as the speaker remarks about how their graves have been covered in moss. Here return the ideas of loss and abandonment that the speaker briefly insinuated in the beginning of the poem, getting to the point of the matter in the loss of “You nobler beings.” The speaker remarks upon how happy they were when together they witnessed the day redden and the night shimmer. This closing line brings the poem full circle, as a repetition of the idea of the quiet, shimmering night and the redness of day are brought together from the previous two strophes.

Willkommen, o silberner Mond,  
Schöner, stiller Gefährt der Nacht!  
Du entfliehst? Eile nicht, bleib,  
Gedankenfreund!  
Sehet, er bleibt, das Gewölk wallte nur  
hin.

Des Mayes Erwachen ist nur  
Schöner noch wie die Sommernacht,  
Wenn ihm Thau, hell wie Licht, aus der  
Locke träuft,  
Und zu dem Hügel herauf röthlich er  
kömt.

Ihr Edleren, ach es bewächst  
Eure Maale schon ernstes Moos!  
O, wie war glücklich ich, als ich noch  
mit euch  
Sahe sich röthen den Tag, schimmern  
die Nacht.

Welcome, o silver moon,  
fair, quiet companion of the night!  
You flee? Don't hurry away - remain,  
friend of thought!  
Look, it stays - it was only the clouds  
that were moving.

Only the awakening May  
is yet fairer than the summer night,  
when dew, bright as light, trickles from  
his locks  
and red, he comes up over the hill.

You nobler beings, alas! overgrown  
are your monuments, with stern moss!  
O, how happy I was when, still with  
you,  
I saw day redden and night glimmer!

**Example 1.17: Friedrich Gottlieb Klopstock, "Die frühen Gräber"<sup>39</sup>**

Gluck approaches this poem with a strophic setting in C major, as the seventh song in his collection, *Klopstocks Oden und Lieder beym Clavier zu Singen* (1786).

Similarly to his setting of "Die Sommernacht," there are few chords other than tonic and dominant. The piano accompaniment is simple, with the right hand doubling the melody as well as adding a simple harmony, often a third below the melody. The melodic line begins with a scalar descent from high E5 to E4 in m. 6, then rises back to E5 in m. 9, where it hovers until climaxing on an F5, which then descends by step to end on C5 (Example 1.18).

---

<sup>39</sup> Translation by Emily Ezust, *Lieder.net*: [https://www.lieder.net/lieder/get\\_text.html?TextId=9437](https://www.lieder.net/lieder/get_text.html?TextId=9437).



Gesang.

1. Will - kom-men, o sil - ber-ner Mond, schö-ner,  
 2. Des Mai - es Er - wa-chen ist nur schö-ner  
 3. Ihr Ed - le - ren, ach es be - wächst eu - re

Piano.

5

stil - ler Ge-fährt der Nacht! du ent-fliehst? Ei - le nicht, bleib, Ge-dan-ken-  
 noch wie die Som-mer-nacht, wenn ihm Thau, hell wie Licht, aus der Lo-cke  
 Maa-le schon ern-stes Moos! O wie war glück-lich ich, als ich noch mit

10

freund! Se-het, er bleibt, — das Ge-wölk' wall - te nur hin,  
 träuft, und zu dem Hü - - - gel her-auf röth - lich er kommt,  
 euch — sa - he sich rö - - - then den Tag, schim-mern die Nacht,

15

se - het, er bleibt, — das Ge - wölk' wall - te nur hin.  
 und zu dem Hü - - - - gel her - auf röth - lich er kommt.  
 sa - he sich rö - - - - then den Tag, schim - mern die Nacht.

Example 1.18: Christoph Willibald Gluck, “Die Frühen Gräber”

The final line of poetry is repeated along with the same melodic figure. This repetition brings the measure total from fourteen to eighteen, rounding out an otherwise brief verse. The rhythmic motive of quarter, two eighths is consistent throughout much of the song, adding a sense of optimistic lilt that is not typical of moon songs. This setting seems to negate any of the longing or sadness felt in the poetry. Rather, it focuses solely on reflecting the beauty of the natural elements in the poem. The only small glimpse of any feeling other than the peace of nature may be grasped by the apex on the high F5 in m. 17, which appears to be reaching for something it cannot quite grasp before falling back to tonic (Example 1.18).

Franz Schubert's setting of this poem (D. 290, September 14, 1815) seems to more closely follow the progression of the poetry. While still set strophically, there is a much greater level of harmonic movement and an unsettled feeling that maps onto the poetry. The song begins and ends in A minor but does not stay in that key for long. By the sixth measure, at the end of the second line of poetry, a perfect authentic cadence occurs in B major. From there, the harmony progresses upward measure by measure, from E minor in m. 7 back to A minor in m. 10. To ease the harmonic uncertainty of this section, the song ends with a perfect authentic cadence in A minor. This harmonic movement reflects the mood/affect in the first strophe of poetry, in which the speaker bemoans that the moon appears to flee, but it was only masked momentarily by moving clouds (Example 1.19).

**Singstimme.** *Etwas geschwind.*

Will - kom - men, o sil - ber - ner Mond, schö - ner, stil - ler Ge -

**Pianoforte.** *p* *cresc.* *p*

5

fähr - te der Nacht! Du ent - fliehst? Ei - le nicht, bleib, Ge - dan - kenfreund!

*pp* *p* *cresc.* *fp*

10

Se - het, er bleibt, das Ge - wölk wall - te nur hin.

*decresc.* *pp*

**Example 1.19: Franz Schubert, “Die Frühen Gräber”**

In the second strophe, the harmonic movement may be characterizing the changing of the seasons and the movement of the moon, coming up from behind the hill. Once the moon appears in the poetry line, the song settles back into A minor, where it started. In the third verse, the unsteady key areas may represent the sense of loss that has settled upon the speaker as he remarks upon the moss growing over their monuments and thinks back to a time when he enjoyed those summer days and evenings with those he has

lost. The full-circle movement in the key areas maps onto the poetry, which starts and ends with the shimmering evening moon.

Curiously, at the beginning of the song, Schubert utilizes the same rhythmic motive that Gluck employs in his setting. Perhaps it is simply to match the meter of the dactylic poetry. After the first two lines, the piano employs more consistent running eighth notes, typical of Schubert's other moon songs. While there is no overt use of any of the moon topics outlined by Michael Cherlin and Sarah Clemmens Waltz, there is a glimpse of the typical flowing topic in the piano in the final three measures. This may be the moon's quiet, short response to the speaker, denoting the fact that he will always be there in the night sky.

Fanny Hensel takes a somber approach to the poem (Op. Posth. 9 *Sechs Lieder* No. 4, written in 1828 and published in 1850), setting it in A $\flat$  major, with the tempo marking "Lento e largo." She plays with the idea of distance in a variety of ways throughout the song. First, the piano stays in a low register through the entirety, with the right hand set in bass clef, the highest note in the accompaniment being a D $\flat$ 4. The left hand delves deep into the ledger lines for the majority of the song, only venturing out of them for a few short measures during the third line of each strophe. These low whole notes in the bass ground the work in a state of sobriety, however, the major key plays with that sense. Meanwhile, the voice soars high above the accompaniment, reaching an F5 at the climax of each verse. There is often even distance between the two hands, other than in the third line of poetry (Example 1.20).

*Lento e largo.*

**Singstimme.**

*p*

1. Will - kom - men o sil - ber - ner Mond,  
 2. Des Mai - es Er - wa - chen ist nur  
 3. Ihr Ed - le - ren, ach! es be - kränzt...

**Pianoforte.**

*p*

7

*cresc.* *cresc.*

1. schö - ner stil - ler Gefärt' der Nacht — du ent - fliehst, ei - le nicht, bleib Ge - dan - kenfreund!  
 2. schö - ner noch wie die Sommer - nacht — wenn ihm Thau, hell wie Licht, aus der Lok - ke träuft  
 3. eu - re Maa - le schon ernstes Moos. — O wie glück - lich war ich, als ich einst mit euch

*cresc.* *dim.*

15

*p tranquillo* *cresc.*

1. u. 2. 3.

1. Se - het er bleibt, das Ge - wölk' wall - - - - - te nur hin. Nacht.  
 2. und zu dem Hü - gel her - auf röth - - - - - lich er kommt.  
 3. sa - he sich rö - then den Tag, schim - - - - - mern die

*p*

**Example 1.20: Fanny Hensel, “Die Fruhen Graber”**

Another way Hensel portrays distance is through large leaps that occur in the melodic line. It begins with the leap of a minor seventh from Eb4 to Db5 in mm. 4-5,

which then descends back down to middle C. While several other leaps occur, the most notable is in the final line of the song, mm. 16-20. The melody goes from E $\flat$  4 to A $\flat$  4, then up to F5 as the climax of the song. From here, the melodic line creates a brief but obvious use of the “shimmering” topic, with a floating melisma that lands on A $\flat$  before ending the line on C4. In the first strophe this appears on the word *wallte*, connoting the movement of the floating clouds. It is not as powerful in strophe two, in which it occurs on the word *röthlich*, describing the reddening day. However, it is the most impactful on the third strophe, in which the melisma happens on the word *schimmern*, directly reflecting the shimmering moon in the floating eighth notes.

Hensel creates a melancholic *Stimmung* through mode mixture with the use of a consistent G $\flat$  that permeates the song. The first occurrence of the G $\flat$  appears in the bass in m. 7, creating a ii $\bar{5}^6$ /IV that morphs into a V $\bar{2}^4$ /iv in the fourth beat of the measure. The G $\flat$  occurs again in the melody in m. 9 as a chromatic upper neighbor at the end of the second line of poetry. Measures 9-12 are briefly in B $\flat$  minor, thereafter the music moves through ascending 5-6 sonorities to regain the home key (mm. 12-13). In the first strophe this is the word “*Nacht*” (night), in the second, “*Sommernacht*” (summer night), and in the third, “*Moos*” (moss). In the first two stanzas, Hensel sets this warm vowel, “ah,” to this dark, warm sonority. This seems to be the point from which the remainder of the song works to regain the Major dominant. Each time, though not so strongly in the second stanza, this is a point of pain for the speaker. This is especially true the third time, in which he/she is describing the moss on the graves of the “nobler beings.” The G $\flat$  is present several other times in the accompaniment, usually occurring as a passing tone.

While Hensel does not utilize the typical “flowing” moon topic, one could argue that she instead uses a “walking” topic, with the consistent quarter notes in the accompaniment. This is made more poignant by the few times the piano pauses, connoting a pause in the speaker’s walking through the forest to the graves of his long-lost friends. While the “walking” does not reflect the moon himself, he is characterized as the “friend of thought” (“*Gedankenfreund*”) that is acting as an ever-present light even when the speaker doubts his presence.

This trio of songs again demonstrate the shift from the 1780s to the 1830s. Not only do the songs get more complicated harmonically and otherwise, but the reading of the poetry seems to have advanced as well. Gluck’s setting is an example of being so straightforward that the deeper meaning of the poetry appears to be completely lost. Schubert demonstrates a knowledge of the longing and loss felt in the poem, but still displays this knowledge through more straightforward means of progressing through key areas until finally landing back on tonic to end each strophe. Hensel provides a richer reading of the actual distance that the speaker feels in relation with those to whom the graves belong. She has given us a truly “sentimental” view of the deeper sense of loss that is felt upon a more thorough reading of Klopstock’s poem, and portrays this in myriad ways throughout her song.

### **Conclusion**

These are two demonstrations of how composers have used or forgone typical moon topoi to compose their *Lieder*. The works also display the movement from “naïve” interpretations of the poetry in the late eighteenth century to more “sentimental” approaches that saw a rise in popularity as the nineteenth century progressed. Further

research may be done in a similar fashion with other moon *Lieder*, and beyond that it may also prove beneficial to trace the history of the use of these moon topics from their inception to present day. Another area of research may be to study songs after the Romantic era which also include the moon, to find whether the same topics are used at other points in history. Yet another potential use for this study may be to use Schiller's description of "naïve" versus "sentimental" to analyze other songs, or even works like character pieces for piano. Since so little has been written about this topic overall, there is much yet to be discovered regarding the impact of the moon upon music, as well as how "naïve" and "sentimental" approaches may allow for a new type of reading of a myriad of songs and other works.



## Chapter Two: The Translator's Voice: Its Implications in Two Translations and Text Settings of "La Luna S'E Venuta a Lamentare" and *Ophelia Lieder*

"La Luna S'E Venuta a Lamentare" is an anonymous Italian folk poem called a "rispetti," or "respect" (a short love poem), translated by both Paul Heyse (published in his book of poems, *Italienisches Liederbuch*, in 1890) and Ferdinand Gregorovius (*Toskanisches Melodien*, a portion of the first volume of his *Wanderjahre in Italien*, published in 1856).<sup>40</sup> Both of these German poets interpreted the original Italian poem quite differently from each other and from the original source poem, and each translation was subsequently set by different composers. Hugo Wolf set many of Heyse's poems, and chose "Der Mond hat eine schwere Klag' erhoben" as the seventh song in his first *Italienisches Liederbuch*, published in 1891. Alexander von Zemlinsky, in his 1898 book of *Lieder, Walzer Gesänge nach toskanischen Volksliedern von Ferdinand Gregorovius*, includes "Klagen ist der Mond gekommen" as the second song.

These settings are entirely disparate musical works, demonstrating the influence of each composer's approach to a poem, but more so the contrasting nature of the German translations by Heyse and Gregorovius. The topic of this research is to determine how and why the translators arrived at such different results, and also give brief analyses of the resulting songs from Zemlinsky and Wolf. In doing so, I will show that it is more profitable to trace each song back to the original Italian poem, rather than compare them to one another, which is the typical starting point in an analysis of this kind.

The second half of this paper utilizes the same concept with another set of works, two different translations of Ophelia's songs from Shakespeare's *Hamlet*, set by Brahms and Strauss. By including another full analysis, I aim to demonstrate that this concept is

---

<sup>40</sup> My title draws inspiration from Edward T. Cone's seminal book, *The Composer's Voice* (University of California Press, 1974); however, any similarities end there, given the subject matter of the current paper.

easily repeatable any time the situation of two translations arises. In the realm of text-music analysis, it is of great import to be aware of the implications of translation and translator's bias, and these examples illustrate one aspect of translation theory that has yet to be discussed at length within this field.

A translator's voice is always present alongside an author's voice. Lawrence Venuti, the instigator of research into the translator's voice, posited that "The voice that the reader hears in any translation made on the basis of *simpatico* is always recognized as the author's, never as a translator's, nor even as some hybrid of the two."<sup>41</sup> However, subsequent scholarship has challenged this assertion, and maintains that the translator's subjectivity is being brought into play whether the reader is aware or not. Mona Baker maintains that the translator "may deliberately re-mould the target text to fit a pre-existing personal and public ideological framework or narrative."<sup>42</sup> Therefore, it is important to maintain consciousness of the translator's potential biases, whatever those may be.

Translation of poetry is decidedly more complex, as the resulting translated poem must follow poetic conventions, such as rhyme and meter. Willis Barnstone claims that translating a poem well takes a true poet: "In poetry, where the complexities of meaning are at a peak, the translated poem is seldom the equal of the great master... Only the highest creative skills can render poetry as poetry in another language."<sup>43</sup> Zhang Qun-Xing purports that because of this difficulty, the best way to analyze translations is to compare them to each other. He states, "Different translators surely deal with the same

---

<sup>41</sup> Lawrence Venuti, *The Translator's Invisibility: A History of Translation* (Routledge, 1995), 238.

<sup>42</sup> Mona Baker, *Translation and Conflict: A Narrative Account* (Routledge, 2006), 78.

<sup>43</sup> Willis Barnstone, *The Poetics of Translation: History, Theory, Practice*. (Yale University Press, 1993), 99.

source text in different ways, so the best way to detect the translator's voice is perhaps by comparing translations or retranslations of the same source text."<sup>44</sup> However, Barnstone posits that the art of poetic translation "is found not in duplication but in approximations, equivalences, and differences."<sup>45</sup>

Each translator will have vastly different "approximations" of the source text based on their own biases and backgrounds. Although there may be certain benefits of comparing two different translations of the same poem, it seems that there is more to be gained by comparing each translated poem to the source text. This is especially true when approaching a song analysis: too many differences exist between Heyse's and Gregorovius's translations to see the subsequent songs by Wolf and Zemlinsky as comparable, down to a structural level. This is due to different syntax placement in the German versions of the poem, along with even more blatant changes to the Italian source text, yielding musical results that accompany these changes in the poetry.

It is often a useful exercise to compare two musical settings of the same poem. In *Conceptualizing Music: Cognitive Structure, Theory, and Analysis*, Lawrence M. Zbikowski gives an example comparing Schumann's and Brahms's settings of "In der Fremde." He creates conceptual integration networks for each song, then using that knowledge is able to claim that Brahms "learned the lessons of Schumann's *Liederjahr*, as well as the many other lessons taught by the music of his century, and he built on

---

<sup>44</sup> Zhang Qun-Xing, "Translator's Voice in Translated Texts," *Journal of Literature and Art Studies* 6, no. 2 (February 2016): 184.

<sup>45</sup> Barnstone, *The Poetics of Translation*, 106.

them.”<sup>46</sup> Zbikowski demonstrates the musical areas in which Brahms built upon Schumann’s initial ideas using these networks to compare the similarities of the works.

However, with such different interpretations of the source text, in this case it may prove more useful to create CINs for each song, comparing them to the Italian source text rather than to each other. In this way, the details of each composer’s interpretation of the German poetry will be mapped onto the direct results of changes from the source text. Another valuable endeavor may be to compare each of these to Ermanno Wolf-Ferrari’s setting of “La Luna s’è Venuta a Lamentare” from his *Il Canzoniere*, Op. 17, published in 1936. Wolf-Ferrari uses the original Italian poem in his song. The musical features ascribed to the poem by Wolf-Ferrari match the source text, providing another way to compare Wolf’s and Zemlinsky’s versions of the song.

The original Italian poem features a free treatment of meter, alternating mostly between iambic and trochaic quatrameter, with a lilting, subtle feel. The poetic structure follows an ABAB CCDD format. At the most dramatic point in the poetry, the phrase “e si lamenta” is repeated. This brings emphasis to the the character portrayal of the moon, shrouding her in sadness in a way which is completely omitted by the German translators. Heyse’s translation is in strict iambic pentameter, but with the same structure as the original poem. Gregorovious interprets the poem in strict trochaic quatremeter, but changes the structure to ABAB CDCD. Fascinatingly, both translators have chosen to adhere to certain elements of the original poetic meter, while forgoing others. This obviously affects the ways in which Wolf and Zemlinsky set the texts to music.

---

<sup>46</sup> Lawrence Zbikowski, *Conceptualizing Music: Cognitive Structure, Theory, and Analysis*. (Oxford University Press, 2002), 284.

La luna s'è venuta a lamentare  
Inde la faccia del divino Amore:  
Dice che in cielo non ci vuol più stare;  
Ché tolto gliel'avete lo splendore.

The moon has come to complain in the  
face of divine love:  
He says he does not want to stay in  
heaven anymore: That the rays had taken  
him away.

E si lamenta, e si lamenta forte.  
L'ha conto le sue stelle, non son tutte.  
E gliene manca due, e voi l'avete:  
Son que' du' occhi che in fronte tenete.

And he complains, and he complains  
loudly  
I count his stars, they are not all  
There are two missing and you have  
them:  
They are those two eyes that you hold on  
your face.

**Example 2.1: Original Italian folk poem, “La luna s'è venuta a lamentare”<sup>47</sup>**

In Heyse's translation, what was “divine love” in Italian, is translated into “the Lord.” Many of Heyse's other poems in his *Italienisches Liederbuch* have distinctly religious elements, some of which he seems to have added to otherwise religiously ambivalent poems. One example is in “Heb' auf dein blondes Haupt und schlafe nicht,” in which the seventh line of the Heyse translation states, “Das dritte: daß ich dir mein Heil befehle” (The third: that I entrust my salvation to you). The Italian poem reads, “La terza, che vi sia raccomandata,” or, in a more literal translation, “The third, which is committed to you.”

Both poets completely change the first line of the second strophe, which in the source text is, “E si lamenta, e si lamenta forte” (and it laments, and it laments loudly). Heyse replaces the line with “Als er zuletzt das Sternenheer gezahlt” (When he last counted the multitude of stars), and Gregorovius with “Seine Sterne ging er Zahlen” (It went to count its stars). The subject of counting stars in the source text is not mentioned

---

<sup>47</sup> Translation from my colleague Rickey Lee Simpson and native Italian speaker S. Pedrotti.

until the line after the lament, forcing the German poets to add another line of poetry to complete their strophes, since both omitted the first line of the second stanza.

Der Mond hat eine schwere Klag’  
erhoben  
Und vor dem Herrn die Sache kund  
gemacht;  
Er wolle nicht mehr stehn am Himmel  
droben,  
Du habest ihn um seinen Glanz gebracht.

The moon has raised a grave complaint  
And made the matter known unto the  
Lord:  
It no longer wants to stay up there in the  
sky,  
For you have robbed it of its radiance.

Als er zuletzt das Sternenheer gezählt,  
Da hab es an der vollen Zahl gefehlt;  
Zwei von den schönsten habest du  
entwendet:  
Die beiden Augen dort, die mich  
verblendet.

When last he counted all the stars,  
The full number was not complete;  
You have purloined two of the loveliest:  
Those two eyes that have blinded me.

**Example 2.2: Paul Heyse, “Der Mond hat eine schwere Klag’ erhoben”<sup>48</sup>**

---

<sup>48</sup> Translation © Richard Stokes, retrieved from <https://www.oxfordlieder.co.uk/song/1618>.

Klagen ist der Mond gekommen,  
Vor der Sonne Angesicht,  
Soll ihm noch der Himmel frommen,  
Da du Glanz ihm nahmst und Licht?

Seine Sterne ging er zählen,  
Und er will vor Leid vergehn:  
Zwei der schönsten Sterne fehlen,  
Die in deinem Antlitz stehn.

The moon has come lamenting  
before the gaze of the sun:  
What use to her are the heavens  
if you have taken away her radiance and  
light?

She went to count her stars,  
and she will die for sorrow:  
two of the fairest stars are missing -  
those that belong to your face

**Example 2.3: Ferdinand Gregorovious, “Klagen ist der Mond gekommen”<sup>49</sup>**

**Wolf's Setting vs. Zemlinsky's Setting**

Wolf's song fits directly into the *ombra* topic as described by Clive McClelland in “Ombra and Tempesta”: high style, in a flat minor key (at least for the first half), a repeated descending tetrachord in the bass, “majestic or ponderous dotted rhythms,” and “sudden outbursts” in the dynamics.<sup>50</sup> When taking into account the slightly more religious bent of this translation of the poem, perhaps the dotted rhythms and lament bass pattern could be taken to represent a type of ceremonial religious moment.

Wolf composed the first *Italienisches Liederbuch*, settings of Heyse's translations of traditional Italian poetry, over the course of 1890. Song seven in this book, “Der Mond hat eine Klag' erhoben,” stands out in a variety of ways: it is set with a Baroque-esque lament bass, with the descending tetrachord moving in parallel tenths against the upper piano part. This dance-like theme and accompanying rhythm sound like a harkening back to other Laments, yet they are happening in a space much more typical of Wolf: the song features directional tonality and distinct key relationships. This paradox creates a sense of

---

<sup>49</sup> Translation by Emily Ezust for Lieder.net: [https://www.lieder.net/lieder/get\\_text.html?TextId=6856](https://www.lieder.net/lieder/get_text.html?TextId=6856).

<sup>50</sup> Clive McClelland, “Ombra and Tempesta,” in *The Oxford Handbook of Topic Theory*. (Oxford University Press, 2014), 282.

longing and loss within a larger Romantic framework, moving toward a goal which fits with the direction of the poetry.

The method by which Wolf accomplishes the efficacy of the lament is worth exploring: How do the key areas relate to the text? What is the significance of the moments in which he breaks the lament bass pattern? There seems to be a theme of thievery throughout the work. Just as the love has stolen the radiance of the moon and glory of the brightest stars, so also does Wolf point to moments being stolen from the music, and anticipations which delude and twist the original harmonic meaning.

In her essay in *Renaissance Quarterly*, Kate van Orden describes the *complainte* as a form of poetry and later a song form tied with the original subject of loss of life, but one which evolved to mean any type of *fin amor*, including death, loss of love, theft, and other crimes.<sup>51</sup> Una McIlvenna takes this concept a step further by citing the use of these *complainte* forms in the announcement of death and crime in eighteenth-century France in her essay entitled, “The Power of Music: The Significance of Contrafactum in Execution Ballads.”<sup>52</sup> The idea of using a *complainte* or Lament to tell of a crime may well be the connection that Wolf was expressing with his choice of text: the moon announcing that his radiance has been stolen from him.

Using these methods as a starting point, Wolf mapped the *complainte* of the poetry onto the form of the Lament, using the descending tetrachord as his motive of choice to portray the lament of the moon (Example 2.4). The origins of the lament, as explained briefly by Ellen Rosand in her essay “The Descending Tetrachord: An Emblem

---

<sup>51</sup> Kate Van Orden, “Female ‘Complaintes’: Laments of Venus, Queens, and City Women in Late Sixteenth-Century France.” *Renaissance Quarterly* 54, no. 3 (Autumn 2001): 802.

<sup>52</sup> Una McIlvenna, “The Power of Music: The Significance of Contrafactum in Execution Ballads.” *Past & Present* 229, no. 1 (November 2015): 49.



of Lament,”<sup>53</sup> are related to the origins of the *passacaglia* and the *ciaccona*, both originally Italian courtly dance forms with specific rhythms matching that of Wolf’s song, as well as the use of parallel tenths within the accompaniment. All of these connections tie it to an earlier genre, harkening back to the days of courtly love and honor.

The image displays a musical score for Hugo Wolf's song "Der Mond hat eine schwere Klag' erhoben." The score is written for voice and piano. It consists of three systems of music, each with a vocal line and a piano accompaniment. The key signature is three flats (B-flat, E-flat, A-flat), and the time signature is 4/4. The lyrics are in German. The first system starts with the vocal line: "Der Mond hat ei - ne schwe - re Klag' er - ho - ben". The piano accompaniment features a descending tetrachord in the right hand, marked with a piano (p) dynamic. The second system begins with the vocal line: "und vor dem Herrn die Sa - - che kund - ge - macht: Er wol - le nicht mehr stehn -". The piano accompaniment continues with the descending tetrachord, marked with a piano (p) dynamic. The third system starts with the vocal line: "- am Him - mel dro - ben, du ha - best ihn um sei - nen Glanz - ge - bracht." The piano accompaniment continues with the descending tetrachord, marked with a piano (pp) dynamic. The score ends with a double bar line.

**Example 2.4: Hugo Wolf, “Der Mond hat eine schwere Klag erhoben,” mm. 1-8**

<sup>53</sup> Ellen Rosand, "The Descending Tetrachord: An Emblem of Lament." *The Musical Quarterly* 65, no. 3 (1979): 346.

At the same time, Wolf does not abandon his keen attention to the specific text points that demand expression. Much has been written about Wolf's response to poetry, including various works by Ernest Newman,<sup>54</sup> as well as close readings of his connection of text and key areas, as explored by Matthew Baileyshea in several articles, including "The Heaviest Weight': Circularity and Repetition in a Song by Hugo Wolf"<sup>55</sup> and "The Hexatonic and the Double Tonic: Wolf's 'Christmas Rose.'"<sup>56</sup> While these studies offer helpful paradigms and approaches to Wolf's works, nothing has been written about this specific song from the *Italienisches Liederbuch*.

While it is clear that Wolf is using the lament bass to signify the moon's sorrow at his loss of radiance (along with the two brightest stars stolen from the heavens), there are also other ways in which he signifies this theft that are worth exploring. I intend to explain how Wolf exploits key areas, specific harmonic devices, and a haunting melody to portray the thievery that is felt so strongly by the Moon in his lament.

One way in which this theft is shown is through the key areas. The song begins in E flat minor, with the lament bass figure played through three times in the accompaniment (Example 2.4, mm. 1-7). In a surprising twist, the pattern is broken by the V chord in E flat minor resolving to III, which serves as a pivot chord, acting as I in the new key of G flat major (Example 2.4, mm. 6-7). The timing of this shift is fitting with the text, at the moment when the singer declares, "for you have robbed him of his radiance." This two-measure key area ends on a half cadence, which leads to the

---

<sup>54</sup> These include "Hugo Wolf and the Lyric," I & II, published in *The Musical Times*, as well as his 1907 book, *Hugo Wolf*.

<sup>55</sup> Matthew Baileyshea, "The Heaviest Weight': Circularity and Repetition in a Song by Hugo Wolf." *Music Analysis* 25, no. 3 (October 2006): 289-314.

<sup>56</sup> Matthew Baileyshea, "The Hexatonic and the Double Tonic: Wolf's 'Christmas Rose.'" *Journal of Music Theory* 51, no. 2 (Fall 2007): 187-210.

beginning of the new poetic strophe in F sharp minor (the enharmonic equivalent of G flat minor, which is the parallel of the key before it) (Example 2.5, m.9). The lament bass pattern is repeated twice in this key area, before modulating back to G flat major and playing the pattern once more (Example 2.5, m. 13).

Als er zu-letzt das Ster - nen-heer ge - zählt, da hab' es an der vol -

12 - len Zahl ge - fehlt, zwei von den schön-sten ha - best du ent - wen - det:

15 (zart) die bei - den Au - gen dort, die mich ver - blen - det.

*p* *cresc.* *f* *p (sehr weich)* *pp* *ppp*

Example 2.5: Hugo Wolf, “Der Mond hat eine schwere Klag erhoben,” mm. 9-18

The most fascinating shift happens in the fourth measure from the end (Example 2.5, m. 15), when the music modulates yet again, this time to C flat major. The lament bass is discarded in these final measures, and the piano cadences with a vii° chord resolving to I in C flat major (Example 2.5, mm. 17-18). Along with several other strange harmonies, there appears to be a sense of certain notes “holding on” to their previous harmonies (for instance, the E flat in the top voice in m. 16), and other notes that have been landed upon too soon. For example, the final C flat and G flat in the left hand anticipate the arrival of the C flat in the final measure, occurring below the vii° chord in the right hand (Example 2.5, m. 17). Perhaps the left hand has “stolen” the arrival of the right hand.

Together, the tonal areas of the song are E flat minor (mm. 1-6), G flat (major, then minor [enharmonically], then major again) (mm. 7-15), and finally C flat major (mm. 16-18). While the progressive tonality in itself expresses the loss and movement of the poem, an analysis of these key areas in relation to each other may be given: Together, they spell the notes in a C flat major triad in first inversion, with the C flat appearing last. This may signify that the C flat has stolen the place where a B flat should occur, which would have rounded out an E flat minor chord (the original key of the song).<sup>57</sup>

The concept of thievery so evident in Wolf’s composition seems to be in direct response to the concept of the missing stars, which is present in the original Italian poem, as well. However, while the Italian verb, “tolto,” means “to take,” the German “gebracht” can mean the same, but may also be translated a bit harsher as “robbed.” This gives Wolf creative ability to explore the concept of thievery that seems to be felt more strongly in

---

<sup>57</sup> C flat major and E flat minor are also related by leading tone (L) in neo-Riemannian theory, therefore each transformation is represented within this short song.

Heyse's translation of the poem. This appears again in the penultimate line of poetry. In the Italian poem, this line reads "E gliene manca due, e voi l'avete" ("There are two missing and you have them"). This is a passive concession on the part of the speaker, that their love "has" those missing stars. In Heyse's translation, however, the love has "stolen" the two fairest stars, ("Zwei von den schönsten habest du entwendet") a much more active and involved interpretation, further solidifying the theme.

In his setting, Zemlinsky utilizes a common lunar topos, the flowing gesture referred to by Sarah Clemmens Waltz as the "Moonlight Convention."<sup>58</sup> This includes a triplet pattern in the piano accompaniment, usually outlining a triad, such as the overarching device used in Beethoven's "Moonlight Sonata," op. 27 no. 2. However, Zemlinsky uses the simple  $\frac{3}{4}$  meter, creating several instances of metrical dissonance (two against three) in both hands of the piano, as well as against the voice. He also sets his song beginning in C sharp minor (perhaps directly reflecting Beethoven's "Moonlight Sonata") and ending in E major, much brighter choices than Wolf's setting.

Zemlinsky's use of directional tonality is fitting when considering the progression of the poetry. The entire first strophe of poetry is set in C sharp minor, maintaining a specific agitated, almost frenzied *Stimmung* through this section, made evident by the quick, consistent triplets in the right hand of the piano (Example 2.6). Also, certain chromatic tones in the melody add to this affect: F double sharp (raised  $\hat{4}$ ) occurs frequently in the melody in this section, adding instability to the otherwise relatively steady melodic line. The most effective instance of the raised  $\hat{4}$  occurs on the final word of the first strophe, on the word "Licht" ("light") in m. 16 (Example 2.6). This ends the

---

<sup>58</sup> Sarah Clemmens Waltz, "In Defense of Moonlight." *Beethoven Forum* 14, no. 1 (2007): 10.

section on a V:HC, leaving the listener in a place of uncertainty which carries through the middle section.

*Poco allegro.*

Kla - gen ist der Mond ge - kom - men  
Sad - ly is the moon com - plain - ing

5  
vor der Son - ne An - ge - sicht,  
How her beams in vain must shine,

9  
soll ihm noch der Him - mel from - men,  
Heav'n on her will smile no lon - ger

13  
da du Glanz ihm nahmst und Licht.  
Now her light is quenched by thine.

Example 2.6: Alexander Zemlinsky, “Klagen ist der Mond gekommen,” mm. 1-16

The middle segment (Example 2.7, mm. 18-25), which contains the first two lines of the second strophe of poetry, is where the modulation to E major is instigated;

however, there is only one brief E major chord, which functions more as a dominant of the following A minor chord (Example 2.7, m. 22). Instead, this section moves through a variety of chords quickly and with no resolution, giving the listener a sense of confusion and angst. The second line of poetry within this section, “Und er will vor Leid vergehn,” (“And he will die for sorrow,” or, more literally, “and he wants from sorrow to die”), is the apex of the song (Example 2.7, mm. 22-25). The harmony under the melodic line of G5, F5, E5, is a sustained A minor chord, introducing mode mixture into the section, making it even more uncertain and unstable. The bridge between this section and the last is a four-measure piano interlude, ending with a Ger°3 chord in m. 29. This chord resolves directly to I in root position as the first chord of the third section (m. 30).

The last section, which encompasses the last two lines of poetry, are incredibly stable and succinct (mm. 30-37). However, the melody repeats the highest three notes from the B section, this time in straight quarter notes instead of dotted-quarter, eighth, quarter (m. 35). In this instance, they affirm the key of E major instead of feeling out of place above an A minor chord. What was unbalanced and unstable has become certain, now that the moon has found the stars he was missing (“Zwei der schönsten Sterne fehlen, Die in deinem Antlitz stehn,” “two of the fairest stars are missing, those that belong to your face”). The progression of both the poetry and the resulting song create three distinct spaces as outlined in the analysis above: The first being unsettled, the second incredibly liminal and even more uncertain, and the third being a settled space.

These action-oriented key areas suit Gregorovich’s translation better than they would fit the original text. In the Italian poem, the moon does not take any action other than “complaining loudly.” In this translation, it “went to count its stars,” and this is

where the harmony moves along with the moon's actions (the first line of the second strophe, congruent with the change from the first to second sections of music). This is also the only version of poetry in which the last two lines of the first stanza are in the form of a question ("Soll ihm noch der Himmel frommen, Da du Glanz ihm nahmst und Licht?") "What use to him are the heavens, if you have taken away his radiance and light?"). This questioning fits the instability Zemlinsky chose in ending the first section with a V:HC in m. 16.

Sei - ne Ster - ne ging er zäh - len  
Does she seek her stars to num - ber?

21 ausdrucksvoll  
crescendo  
und er will vor Leid ver -  
Pale she turns with jea - lou -

25 gehn:  
syi dolce dim.

30 a tempo ruhig  
tranquillo  
Zwei der schön - sten Ster - ne feh - len, die in  
For two glo - rious orbs are miss - ing, Which are

35 rit.  
Dei - nem Ant - litz stehn.  
shi - ning, Love, in thee!  
p rit. pp

Example 2.7: Alexander Zemlinsky, "Klagen ist der Mond gekommen," mm. 17-41



Since each translation yields such a disparate resulting song, I argue that it is more beneficial to compare each song to the original source poem rather than to each other. It would be fruitless to try to directly compare Wolf's setting with Zemlinsky's. Wolf appears to have focused on the idea of thievery, which is more prevalent in Heyse's interpretation, while Zemlinsky has instead managed to create three different scenes with his use of key areas and piano accompaniment. By noticing which words and phrases were distinctly changed from the Italian poem, it was easy to see how that played into each composer's song. This method may be a guide for others who come across other songs that have multiple translations, as well as further the research into Wolf and Zemlinsky's *oeuvres*, the latter of whom especially has had few scholarly works written about him.

### **Brahms's vs. Strauss's *Ophelia Lieder***

Just as compelling an example of this concept are the *Ophelia Lieder* set by Brahms and Strauss. They serve as another case study in which simply comparing songs of differing translations as equals does not do justice to the ways in which the meanings of the texts have been altered by its translators. Using these two quite disparate examples of the song literature, I will show that this method of analysis may be applied to more than just the first two songs in question, while also bringing to light this fascinating aspect of translation theory that has yet to be uncovered at a deeper level in the song analysis literature. As long as there are poetic works being translated, there will be this question of how to compare translations of the same original works. However, this exact practice of comparing (or purposefully *not* comparing) works that use different translations of the same source poem is one that has yet to be explored on a larger scale.

The other set of songs in question originate from Ophelia's songs (and song fragments) from Act IV of Shakespeare's *Hamlet*. According to Carroll Camden in her essay, "On Ophelia's Madness," Ophelia goes mad in part because of her belief that Hamlet loves her, and her actions reflect that love while she is still being used as a pawn by Polonius. Camden states, "Throughout the play, indeed, the appearance of Hamlet's pretended madness is contrasted with the reality of Ophelia's madness."<sup>59</sup> This ironic juxtaposition is felt especially at the points in the play in which Ophelia sings her disjointed songs, which often seem entirely unrelated to the context in which she is singing, adding to the sense of madness. According to Camden, these symptoms of madness were brought on by lovesickness, something that would have been obvious to Elizabethan audiences.<sup>60</sup>

Yi-Yeon Park's dissertation studies the various settings of the Ophelia Lieder, considering translations into various languages of the original source poetry. The list of composers who set these songs is long, including Berlioz, Saint-Saens, and Zumsteeg. The settings discussed in the current paper were written by Brahms (*Fünf Ophelia Lieder*, WoO 22, written 1873 and published 1935) and Strauss (*Drei Lieder der Ophelia*, Op. 67, 1919). Park notes of Ophelia, "In her insanity, she symbolizes incorrigibility and virtue, and her early death represents the preservation of such precious innocence that must not be defiled. Ophelia remains memorable amidst Shakespeare's minor characters not only as a thematically symbolic character, but also as the device of dramatic effect and instrument of pathos."<sup>61</sup> Park also states that the translations into German made by

---

<sup>59</sup> Carroll Camden, "On Ophelia's Madness," *Shakespeare Quarterly* 15, no. 2 (1964): 249.

<sup>60</sup> Camden, "On Ophelia's Madness," 255.

<sup>61</sup> Yi-Yeon Park, "A Study of German, French, and English Vocal Settings of Ophelia from Shakespeare's *Hamlet*" (PhD diss., Indiana University, 2013), 16.

Ludwig Tieck and August Schlegel led to an interest in *Hamlet*, and therefore, Ophelia, in German-speaking countries during the Romantic era.

To give further context to Ophelia's songs in her "mad scene," Park explains the use of song within Elizabethan theater:

Songs in the play, like those of Ophelia, had particular meanings and functions in the Elizabethan era. The dramatic functions of the songs in Elizabethan plays were especially diverse. They were used to portray character, to establish settings, to foreshadow, and to forward action. The Elizabethan dramatists borrowed many of their musical devices from a common fund, and Shakespeare was not the only one, nor even the first, to use music in many ways... [Ophelia's] singing also increases the tragic impression of her isolation in madness, and implies that tragic developments have already moved beyond the possibility of control. Playwrights increased their dramatic effects by including lyrics that were sometimes lurid, sometimes gay or vulgar, or appropriately mournful. Shakespeare's interfusion of the lyrical in and through the drama is to be commended for its subtle concordance of plot and character development.<sup>62</sup>

Park later touches on the fact that Brahms and Strauss use different translations of the English text and mentions a few of the disparities, but that is the length of her analysis of this particular issue.

Brahms' settings of the Ophelia Lieder were written for a specific purpose: to serve as the actual melodies used in a performance of *Hamlet*. He was approached by Joseph Lewinsky, who asked him to write these songs for a production in which Lewinsky's fiancée, Olga Precheisen, was playing the part of Ophelia. Although the songs were performed unaccompanied, Brahms added simple piano accompaniments so that it would be easier for Precheisen to memorize the tunes for the play. Lewinsky wrote to Precheisen in November of 1873, stating the following:

---

<sup>62</sup> Park, 20-21.

Brahms has written a piano accompaniment for songs, so that you may learn them more easily...He is of the opinion that, on the stage, something simple often makes a greater effect. But you will surely be able to feel yourself into the spirit of folk-song in which they are conceived.<sup>63</sup>

Therefore, it is important to note that Brahms' *Ophelia Lieder* serve an incredibly specific purpose in this way, and are intentionally simplistic and straightforward. Also, since this is for a performance, Brahms adheres strictly to the forms of the poems as they appear in the script. This is unlike Strauss' setting, which blends together these song snippets into three distinct Lieder instead of the original five.

Brahms uses Schlegel's translation of *Hamlet*, which was completed in 1798. According to Roger Paulin, emeritus professor of German at the University of Cambridge, Schlegel tried to recreate *Hamlet* as literally as possible in German. He states,

As a translator, Schlegel sees himself as coming at a time when the German language and its poetic powers of expression are now adequate to the ultimate challenge of Shakespeare in his original form. Unlike his great rival, Johann Heinrich Voss, Schlegel did not believe in forcing the language; rather, he proceeded from the maxim, "what the language is capable of" (1846-7, 7: 62). That would mean rendering Shakespeare's verse, where possible, line for line, even allowing for irregularities.<sup>64</sup>

Paulin admits that this literal interpretation does not always yield the most poetic lines in comparison with Shakespeare's original. He concedes that it is not a good theater text, but that nothing over the past two hundred years has come anywhere close, and it is the benchmark against which other translations have been measured.

---

<sup>63</sup> Karl Geiringer, *Fünf Ophelia-Lieder, für eine Sopranstimme und Klavierbegleitung*, (Schönborn, 1960), 5.

<sup>64</sup> Roger Paulin, "Hamlet In Germany," <http://triggs.djvu.org/globallanguage.com/ENFOLDED/BIBL/HamGer.htm>.

Strauss chose to use Simrock's setting of *Hamlet* (published in 1868 as part of his larger work, *Shakespeare in deutscher Übersetzung*) for his *Drei Lieder der Ophelia*, which was published in 1918 as the first three songs in the set *Sechs Lieder* (Op. 67). Apparently, Strauss did not want to write this collection of *Lieder*, but owed several songs to his publishers, Bote & Bock, and these three Ophelia songs, along with three poems by Goethe, were the result.<sup>65</sup> Simrock's text varies significantly from Schlegel's translation, causing a similar quandary as comparing Zemlinsky and Wolf's settings of the same Italian folk poem: they end up differently enough that it is not beneficial to compare them to each other, except to note the differences that result from the opposing texts. Instead, it is more productive to compare each German translation to the original English to see where those diversions lie in each composition. As mentioned previously, Schlegel was fastidious about translating Shakespeare into German in the most literal way possible, allowing for certain phrases to come out less poetically, but getting almost the same message across. While it is clear that Simrock was a thorough scholar of Shakespeare's plays,<sup>66</sup> little has been written specifically about his translations of them. They do function quite smoothly in Strauss's songs, as his scansion is perhaps slightly more poetic than Schlegel's more literal setting.

The first song in Brahms' *Ophelia Lieder* is, "Wie erkenn' ich dein Treulieb." The original text, as found in Shakespeare, is as follows:

How should I your true love know  
 From another one?  
 By his cockle hat and staff,  
 And his sandal shoon

---

<sup>65</sup> Silvia Pujalte, "Ophelia and Strauss," *Liederabend*, last modified May 31, 2017, <https://www.liederabend.cat/en/bloc/entrades/731-ophelia-and-strauss>.

<sup>66</sup> See his extensive book, *The Remarks of Karl Simrock on the Plots of Shakespeare's Plays*.

He is dead and gone, lady,  
 He is dead and gone;  
 At his head a grass-green turf,  
 At his heels a stone.

White was his shroud as the mountain snow,—  
 Larded with sweet flowers;  
 Which to the grave did go  
 With true-love showers. (IV. v. 23-39)

The first stanza is from the famous Walsingham poem, which was a traditional, well-known text. However, the other lines do not appear with this poem in *The Garland of Good Will*, but may have been known as other verses accompanying the original.<sup>67</sup>

**Andante con moto**

1. Wie er- kenn' ich dein Treu- lieb vor den an- dem nun?  
 2. Er ist lan- ge tot\_ und hin, tot und hin, Fräu- lein!

**riten.**

An dem Mu- schel hut\_ und Stab\_ Und den San- dal- schuh'n.  
 Ihm zu Häup- ten ein Ra- sen grün, ihm zu Fuß ein Stein.

### Example 2.8: Johannes Brahms, “Song I,” *Ophelia Lieder*

<sup>67</sup> Camden, “On Ophelia’s Madness,” 251.

A few of the words in Schlegel's setting are altered from the original Shakespeare, but nothing that drastically changes the song's meaning. In the third stanza, however, there is a greater diversion from the original. While Shakespeare's version describes the shroud as "larded with sweet flowers," Schlegel describes the shroud as "affected with flowers sweet" ("geziert mit Blumen seggen"), and "which to the grave did go/with true-love showers" is translated as, "which bewept to the grave must go with love's rain" ("das unbetränt zum Grab muß gehn vol Liebesregen"). While a few different words are changed to keep the scansion, in general this text remains true to the original folk poem.

Brahms' setting for the first two stanzas is strophic, and utilizes a meter which alternates between  $\frac{4}{4}$  and  $\frac{6}{4}$  time, giving it a lilting, chantlike feeling. Set in C minor and only six measures long, Brahms employs a parallel period (V:PAC in m. 3, PAC in m. 6), which complements the question-answer dialogue in the first strophe. The emphasis on the tonic and dominant in the melody also lends itself to the feeling of a chant (Example 2.8).

Sein Lei- chen-hemd- weiß wie Schnee zu sehn, ge- ziert mit Blu- men-

4  
se- gen, das un- be- trânt zum Grab muß gehn von Lie- bes- re- gen.

**Example 2.9: Johannes Brahms, “Song II,” *Ophelia Lieder***

The third strophe appears in the play after a brief pause in which the Queen tries to say something, but Ophelia asks her to listen. Brahms uses this interchange to shift the tone, setting the third strophe as a completely new song in the publication, while also changing the key and meter at this break in the music. This portion consists of two identical phrases that begin in G major and cadence in E minor. While part of the same original song, Brahms makes this third strophe seem like an entirely new idea. This emphasizes the character’s lunacy, especially with the G major start, as Ophelia sings of the white shroud affected with flowers in a sing-song manner that then shifts back to darkness at the end of each phrase (Example 2.9).

Simrock’s translation of this song, used by Strauss, is much less literal than these few word changes made by Schlegel. He takes great liberty with the original text,



changing not only details, but even basic pronouns, shifting “dein” to “mein” in the first poem. This change turns the song from a dialogue between the pilgrim and the protagonist to just a monologue by the speaker. Park Yi-Yeon observes that this change may make Ophelia seem even more mad, as she is now in direct dialogue with herself, questioning and answering herself in the song:<sup>68</sup> “Wie erkenn ich **mein** Treulieb vor andern nun? An dem Muschelhut und Stab und den Sandalschuhn.” This is in contrast with Schlegel’s version, “Wie erkenn’ ich **dein** Treulieb vor den andern nun? An dem Muschel hut und Stab Und den Sandalschuh’n.”

Since Strauss created his songs as *Lieder* instead of for direct use in a play, he was able to rearrange and connect the texts in a way in which Brahms could not. Therefore, he combined Brahms’ first two songs to create his “Erstes Lied der Ophelia.” This creates much greater continuity, as the strophes are from the same original song; as mentioned earlier, Brahms separated them because of the pause in Ophelia’s declamation, caused by dialogue in the play, though he certainly could have continued the song instead of setting it to completely new music in a different key. Along with this change in speaker, Simrock also anthropomorphizes the flowers in the poem: “Auf seinem Bahrtuch, weiß wie Schnee, viel liebe Blumen trauern. Sie gehn zu Grabe naß, o weh! Vor Liebesschauern” (“On his pall white with snow, many dear flowers mourn. They go to the grave wet, oh dear!— forth from love’s showers”). Again, this is a bit more poetic than Schlegel’s translation, but certainly a stretch from the original.

---

<sup>68</sup> Park Yi-Yeon, 46.

**Leicht bewegt** Ophelia (im Wahnsinn)

**Gesang** Wie er-kenn ich mein

**Piano** *p*

7  
Treu - lieb vor an - dern nun? An dem Mu-schel-hut und

13  
Stab und den San-dal-schuhn. — Er ist tot und

20  
lan - ge hin, tot und hin, Fräulein! Ihm zu Häup - ten

*mf* *pp* *sf* *sf* *sf* *sf*

**Example 2.10: Richard Strauss, “Erstes Lied der Ophelia,” mm. 1-26**

Strauss is able to create a very different *Stimmung* than Brahms due to the nature of his intent for these songs. Instead of being used for the theater, these are purely art songs to be performed with a piano. Strauss uses the piano as another voice in this dialogue, employing a motive that is passed between the piano and singer, and repeated

frequently. This motive is incredibly chromatic and unstable, and its frequent repetition adds to the feelings of madness and absurdity. The vocal line moves relatively slowly while the piano whirls around her, giving the impression that Ophelia is lost within a world which she does not understand. Also, Ophelia repeats an augmented version of the motive at half the speed of the piano, giving the feeling that she is stuck in her own world, moving at half the speed of those around her (Example 2.10, piano motive in m. 2-3, vocal imitation in mm. 5-8).

In “Auf morgen ist Sankt Valentins Tag,” Brahms again uses a strophic setting, which certainly would have been easier to memorize for a performance in a play. At the same time, it mimics how this song may have been performed in its various folk iterations. Set in  $\frac{6}{8}$  time, Brahms uses a consistent quarter-note, eighth-note alternating rhythm to match the scansion of Schlegel’s consistently iambic meter. Sounding almost like a bar song, Brahms’s interpretation certainly is on par with the bawdy theme of the poem (Example 2.11). The original words as they appear in Hamlet are as follows:

To-morrow is Saint Valentine's day,  
 All in the morning betime,  
 And I a maid at your window,  
 To be your Valentine.  
 Then up he rose, and donn'd his clothes,  
 And dupp'd the chamber-door;  
 Let in the maid, that out a maid  
 Never departed more....  
 By Gis and by Saint Charity,  
 Alack, and fie for shame!  
 Young men will do't, if they come to't;  
 By cock, they are to blame.  
 Quoth she, before you tumbled me,  
 You promised me to wed.  
 So would I ha' done, by yonder sun,  
 An thou hadst not come to my bed. (IV v. 48-66)

Auf mor- gen ist Sankt Va- len- tins Tag, wohl-  
tat an- sein Kleid, tat

an der Zeit noch früh, und ich, 'ne Maid, am Fen- ster-schlag will  
auf die Kam- mer- tür, ließ ein die Maid, die als 'ne Maid ging

sein eu'r Val- len- tin, will sein eu'r Va- len- tin, eu'r  
nim- mer- mehr her- für, ging nim- mer- mehr her- für, her-

**Example 2.11: Johannes Brahms, “Song III,” *Ophelia Lieder*, mm. 1-11**

In his translation, Schlegel adheres closely to the original words, especially for the first two strophes. However, he made a few concessions in the last several lines. For instance, instead of the line, “Young men will do’t, if they come to’t; By cock, they are to blame,” Schlegel has penned, “Ein junger Mann tut’s wenn er kann, beim Himmei s’ist nicht fein,” (“a young man does it if he can, in heaven it is not fine”).

Another element which makes this feel like a bar song is the repetition of phrases at the end of each strophe. For example, at the end of verse one, the words are, “die als

‘ne Maid ging nimmermehr herfur, ging nimmermehr herfur, herfur.” This device is used for all four stanzas, dragging out what would fill eight measures into eleven with the extra words (Example 2.11, mm. 8-11).

From the start, Simrock changes the setting of the song. Instead of “auf Morgen ist Sankt Valentins Tag,” he writes, “Guten Morgen, ’s ist Sankt Valentinstag.” This shift in the day matters little in the long run, but is certainly a drastic and unnecessary change from the original. Simrock also changes the saints used in the poem: “By Gis and by Saint Charity” becomes, “Bei Sankt Niklas und Charitas!”

Strauss’ interpretation feels lighthearted with a touch of whimsy and spunk, in contrast to the first song. He seems to lean into the quirky, racy nature of the poetry in the piano part, which plays consistent sixteenth-note block chords that alternate between the high and low registers of the keyboard (Example 2.12). Again, the piano is moving significantly faster than the vocal line, keeping the feeling of frenzy as observed in the first song, but this iteration seems to play on the joke of the risqué poetry instead of focusing on Ophelia’s madness.

The image shows a musical score for Richard Strauss's "Zweites Lied der Ophelia". It consists of two systems of music. The first system has a vocal line (Gesang) and a piano accompaniment (Piano). The vocal line is in D major and 3/8 time, with the lyrics "Gu-ten Morgen, 's ist Sankt Va-len-tins-tag, so früh vor Son-nen-schein. Ich jun-ge". The piano accompaniment features a right-hand melody (r. H.) and a left-hand accompaniment (l. H.) with a forte (f) dynamic. The second system continues the vocal line with the lyrics "Maid am Fen-ster-schlag will Eu-er Va-len-tin sein. Der". The piano accompaniment continues with a piano (p) dynamic and a diminuendo (dim.) marking.

**Example 2.12: Richard Strauss, “Zweites Lied der Ophelia,” mm. 1-11**

While this pair of songs does not have as many structural changes as other differing translations, there is enough that differs for the comparison to be made difficult. For example, the simple difference between the opening lines (“auf Morgen ist Sankt Valentins Tag” vs. “Guten Morgen, 's ist Sankt Valentins Tag”) renders the poem from completely different vantage points, making comparison useless in this instance.

Songs IV and V in Brahms’ set (Examples 2.13 and 2.14) both appear within Strauss’ third (and final) song, which also includes a few lines of poetry not found in Brahms’ setting. Again, the difference in the utility of the songs warrant the composers’ disparate choices, further supporting my assertion that they are less profitably compared to each other, rather to the original songs which occur in Hamlet.

Brahms combines two of the song fragments, since one is a single line Ophelia recites from a Robin Hood song, “For Bonny Sweet Robin is all my joy.” The other fragment comes from the song, “They bore him barefaced on the bier:”

They bore him barefaced on the bier,  
Hey, non nonny, nonny, hey, nonny,  
And in his grave rained many a tear.

Both translators chose to change the words “Hey non nonny” to “leider, ach leider!” (“Regrettably/unfortunately!”), in this way maintaining the feeling of the funeral dirge. The cheerful “Hey non nonny” confuses the line while also adding to the irony of Ophelia’s inner turmoil. Brahms includes another line not found in the original Shakespeare play, “Nunter, hinunter! Und ruft ihr ihn ‘nunter” (“Down, down! And you call him down.”). Brahms’ setting is slow and somber, in G minor; however, the final line of this song is “Denn trautlieb Franzel ist all’ meine Lust” (“For sweet-loving Franzel is all my pleasure,” Schlegel’s take on the original, “For bonny sweet Robin is all my joy”). On this line, the song cadences in B flat major, showing just how quickly Ophelia can shift from one emotion to the next (Example 2.13).

The musical score is for Johannes Brahms' "Song IV," Ophelia Lieder. It is written in G minor, 8/8 time. The score consists of two systems of music. The first system contains the lyrics "Sie tru- gen ihn auf der Bah- re bloß, lei- der, ach". The second system contains the lyrics "lei- der! Und man- che Trän' fiel in Gra- bes Schoß." The music features a vocal line and a piano accompaniment. The piano part has markings "p dolce" and "più p". The key signature changes to B-flat major for the final line.

**Example 2.13: Johannes Brahms, “Song IV,” *Ophelia Lieder***

Song V changes meters from  $\frac{6}{8}$  to  $\frac{6}{4}$ , slowing things down even further. This final song is another funeral dirge, which makes the “bonny sweet Robin” line seem even more out of place between these two solemn songs. The verses appear as such in Hamlet:

And wil he not come againe?  
And wil he not come againe?  
No, no, he is dead,  
Goe to thy death bed.  
He never will come againe.

His beard was as white as snow,  
All flaxen was his poll.  
He is gone, he is gone,  
And we cast away moan,  
God a mercy on his soule.—

Schlegel’s verses vary little from these lines, keeping the literal meaning in all respects. Brahms chose to repeat the last words of each strophe to complete his song (“er kommt ja nimmer, nimmer, nimmer zurück” / “und kein Lied bringt Gewinn; Gott helf’ ihm ins Himmelreich, ins Himmelreich!”). In direct reflection of the previous song, Brahms begins song V in B flat major, then ends each strophe in G minor instead, going from a place of potential hope and questioning (“Und kommter nicht mehr zuruck?”) to utter despair (Example 2.14).



**Con moto**

1. Und kommt-er nicht mehr zu- rück? Und kommt-er nicht mehr zu-  
 2. Sein Bart war so weiß wie Schnee, sein Haupt dem Flach- se

*poco f*

4

rück? Er ist tot, o weh! In dein To- des- bett  
 gleich: Er ist hin, ist hin, und kein Leid bringt Ge-

**Example 2.14: Johannes Brahms, “Song V,” *Ophelia Lieder*, mm. 1-7**

Strauss includes each of these song fragments in his third song, “Sie trugen ihn auf der Bahre bloß.” Strauss also adds Ophelia’s final words in Hamlet, “and of all Christian souls, I pray God. God bless you” to finish his song cycle. Simrock’s version of the first song fragment is quite similar to Schlegel’s translation until the final line. Instead of “Nunter, hinunter! Und ruft ihr ihn ‘nunter,” Simrock has added, “fahr wohl, fahr wohl, meine Taube!” (“Fair well, fair well, my dove!”). After this, the piano gives a brief interlude, breaking from its pattern of slow sixteenth-note triplets, and changes tempo from *Ruhig gehend* (“walking slowly”) to *sehr rasch und lustig* (very quick and funny), and from  $\frac{4}{8}$  to  $\frac{3}{4}$  for the “bonny sweet Robin” line (Example 2.15, mm. 17-21). “Mein junger frischer Hansel ist’s, der mir gefällt—“ (“my young fresh Hansel is what I like”) is quite a departure from “For bonny sweet Robin is all my joy.” Its insertion in this song

feels much more out of place than in the Brahms, due to the distinct tempo change, and the quick, high notes in the voice add to the seeming hysteria.

wohl, meine Tau - - - be!

16 **sehr rasch und lustig**  
Mein jun-ger fri-scher Han-sel ist's,

20 **wieder langsamer (tempo primo)**  
der mir ge - fällt - und kommt er nim-mer-mehr?

Example 2.15: Richard Strauss, “Drittes Lied der Ophelia,” mm. 13-23

After this line, the tempo returns to its original speed (m. 22), but the triplets do not return until four measures into the new song fragment (Example 2.16). Strauss creates a halting feeling between the voice and the piano, then the piano regains its motive and the voice continues on with a similar melody as at the start of the song for the rest of the first stanza.

24  
Er ist tot, o weh! In dein

27  
Tot - bett geh, er kommt dir

**Example 2.16: Richard Strauss, “Drittes Lied der Ophelia,” mm. 24-29**

However, for the second strophe, Strauss reverts back to the tempo and motives used in the “bonny sweet Robin” section (Example 2.17), which is wildly ironic considering the words: “Sein Bart war weiss wie Schnee, sein Haupt wie Flachs dazu, Er ist hin, er ist hin, kein Trauern bringt Gewinn” (“His beard was white as snow, his head like flax. He's gone, he's gone, no grief brings profit”). Again, the piano and voice alternate, creating a frenzied dialogue.

35 *sehr rasch*

Sein Bart — war

38 weiß — wie Schnee, sein Haupt

*mf* *dim.*

42 wie Flachs da-zu. Er ist hin,

*p*

46 er ist hin, kein Trau - ern bringt Ge - winn:

*dim.* *pp*

Example 2.17 Richard Strauss, “Drittes Lied der Ophelia,” mm. 35-49

There is a sudden pause, then a final shift back to  $\frac{4}{8}$  and a slower tempo (Example 2.18). Here, Strauss has chosen to set Ophelia's final words from the play: "Mit seiner Seele Ruh und mit allen Christenseelen! Darum bet ich! Gott sei mit euch!" ("Peace with his soul and with all Christian souls! That's why I'm praying! God be with you!").

The musical score for Richard Strauss's "Drittes Lied der Ophelia," mm. 50-58, is presented in two systems. The first system, starting at measure 50, is marked "wieder langsam" and features a vocal line with the lyrics "Mit sei - ner See - le Ruh und mit al - len Chri - sten - see - len!" and a piano accompaniment with a forte dynamic. The second system, starting at measure 54, is marked "immer ruhiger" and "sehr langsam," and features a vocal line with the lyrics "Dar - um bet ich! Gott sei mit euch!" and a piano accompaniment with a piano dynamic and a triplet figure. The score includes various musical notations such as clefs, key signatures, time signatures, dynamics, and articulation marks.

Example 2.18: Richard Strauss, "Drittes Lied der Ophelia," mm. 50-58

## Conclusion

While clearly Brahms and Struass had different intentions for their songs, their uses of different translations had an effect in their text settings as well. Schlegel's straightforward interpretation of the lines yield a simpler, more obvious result from Brahms, while Simrock's more free interpretations seem to better fit Strauss's intent. These cycles add to the evidence that it makes more logical sense to compare each translation to the original source poetry instead of to each other.

Each of the above studies illustrate importance of understanding both the original text and the potential differences in a translated text. Even when not comparing different translations of the same source text, these studies should serve as a reminder to carefully study the context of a translation whenever it appears in a song. The “translator’s voice” is always at play in any translated work, and should be taken into account. This is especially true in the scenarios discussed above, as they reveal the level at which a translator may have had an active role in shaping the resulting music.

Further research into similar translation scenarios may be warranted to solidify this approach, but these examples both show this approach to be effective. This research may provide insight for theorists in both translation studies and text-music analysis, and may hopefully yield greater discussion of how to approach these situations. As song and text-music analysis remain an active genre within music theory, this paper is a bridge between the worlds of music theory and translation theory, hopefully beginning new and deeper conversations around this topic in each respective discipline.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

Austin, Frederic. 1911-1912. "The Songs of Hugo Wolf." *Proceedings of the Musical Association*, 38th Session: 161-169.

Baileyshea, Matthew. "'The Heaviest Weight': Circularity and Repetition in a Song by Hugo Wolf." *Music Analysis* 25, no. 3 (October 2006): 289-314.

Baileyshea, Matthew. "The Hexatonic and the Double Tonic: Wolf's 'Christmas Rose.'" *Journal of Music Theory* 51, no. 2 (Fall 2007): 187-210.

Baker, Mona. *Translation and Conflict: A Narrative Account*. London and New York: Routledge, 2006.

Barnstone, Willis. *The Poetics of Translation: History, Theory, Practice*. New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1993.

Burkholder, J. Peter, Donald Jay Grout, Claude V. Palisca. "The Romantic Generation: Song and Piano Music." In *A History of Western Music*. New York: W.W. Norton & Co., 2014.

Cherlin, Michael. "'Pierrot Lunaire' as Lunar Nexus," *Music Analysis* 31, no 2. (July 2012): 176-215.

Dittrich, Marie-Agnes. "The Lieder of Schubert." In *The Cambridge Companion to the Lied*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004.

Ferber, Michael. *A Dictionary of Literary Symbols*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007.

Geiringer, Karl. *Fünf Ophelia-Lieder, für eine Sopranstimme und Klavierbegleitung*. Wien: Schönborn, 1960.

Glauert, Amanda. "The Lieder of Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach, Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven." In *The Cambridge Companion to the Lied*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004.

Goldfarb, Hilliard T. "Defining 'Naive and Sentimental' Landscape: Schiller, Hackert, Koch, and the Romantic Experience." *The Bulletin of the Cleveland Museum of Art* 69, no. 9 (November 1982): 282-296.

Hatto, A.T. "The Lime-Tree and Early German, Goliard and English Lyric Poetry." *The Modern Language Review* 49, no. 2. (April 1954): 193-209.

Huovinen, Erkki, and Anna-Kaisa Kaila. "The Semantics of Musical Topoi: An Empirical Approach." *Music Perception: An Interdisciplinary Approach* 33, no. 2. (December 2015): 217-233.

Lovejoy, Arthur O. "Schiller and the Genesis of Romanticism, Part II." *Modern Language Notes* 35, no. 3 (March 1920): 136-146.

McClelland, Clive. "Ombra and Tempesta." In *The Oxford Handbook of Topic Theory*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014.

McIlvenna, Una. "The Power of Music: The Significance of Contrafactum in Execution Ballads." *Past & Present* 229, no. 1 (November 2015): 47-89.

Newman, Ernest. "Hugo Wolf and the Lyric." *The Musical Times* 56, no. 873 (November 1915): 649-651.

Newman, Ernest. "Hugo Wolf and the Lyric II." *The Musical Times* 56, no. 874 (December 1915): 718-722.

Park, Yi-Yeon. "A Study of German, French, and English Vocal Settings of Ophelia from Shakespeare's Hamlet." PhD diss., Indiana University, 2013.

Parsons, James. "The Eighteenth-Century Lied." In *The Cambridge Companion to the Lied*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004.

Qun-Xing, Zhang. "Translator's Voice in Translated Texts." *Journal of Literature and Art Studies* 6, No. 2 (February 2016): 178-185.

Ratner, Leonard. *Classic Music: Expression, Form, and Style*. New York: MacMillan Publishing Co., 1980.

Rosand, Ellen. "The Descending Tetrachord: An Emblem of Lament." *The Musical Quarterly* 65, no. 3 (1979): 346-59.

Schiller, Friedrich. *Naïve and Sentimental Poetry* (1795). Translated by William F. Wertz, Jr. Washington D.C.: The Schiller Institute, 2005.

Van Orden, Kate. "Female 'Complaintes': Laments of Venus, Queens, and City Women in Late Sixteenth-Century France." *Renaissance Quarterly* 54, no. 3 (Autumn 2001): 801-845.

Venuti, Lawrence. *The Translator's Invisibility: A History of Translation*. London and New York: Routledge, 1995.



Waltz, Sarah Clemmens. "In Defense of Moonlight." *Beethoven Forum* 14, no. 1 (Spring 2007): 1-43.

Zbikowski, Lawrence. *Conceptualizing Music: Cognitive Structure, Theory, and Analysis*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002.

## VITA

Abigail H. Rueger

### EDUCATION

Bachelor of Arts (May 2016), Thomas Edison State University, Trenton, New Jersey.

### ACADEMIC EMPLOYMENT

Graduate Teaching Assistant, Department of Music Theory, University of Kentucky, August 2017 – May 2020. Responsibilities included: preparation and presentation of undergraduate music theory courses, grading, and tutoring.